

Audio file

[booklauncheventnonoyaacov.MP3](#)

Transcript

00:00:08

OK. Hello everyone.

00:00:10

Thank you for joining us this afternoon at this book event to celebrate the publication of to be a Jewish state. Zionism as the Jew, new as the new Judaism authored by our own Professor Yaakov Yadgar and published by New York University Press.

00:00:22

I.

00:00:28

Our discussion today will focus on the relationship between the five chapters of the book. The chapters can be read independently of one another. Nevertheless, integrating them results in a unique.

00:00:40

I.

00:00:43

And comprehensive analysis, which is our goal this afternoon.

00:00:47

The book opens with a question no quoting. What does it mean for Israel to be a joy state? What is Zionism in relation to Judaism? End of quote.

00:00:58

While these fundamental question runs throughout the book, Yakov reminds us that it is not just about Israel itself, but about nationalism in a broader context. Consequently, Yakov teaches us that the State of Israel should not be seen as a particular case.

00:01:17

But rather as an exception, they ought, it offers the prospect of proving the rule.

00:01:23

The distinction between a state of the of the Jews and a Jewish state which stands at the centre of the Chapter 1 carries some significant implications. The first is the state of the Jews, a sovereign entity made-up of Jews.

00:01:38

As a result, this option requires the Jewish state to be mindful of demographics, meaning it must prevent an imbalance between the Jewish majority and the non Jewish Palestinian minority. Meanwhile, the Jewish state.

00:01:53

Option establishes certain normative, ethnic, ethical, and moral principles.

00:01:58

That align with what one might refer to as Jewish heritage.

00:02:03

Through this juxtaposition, Yakov initiates another essential debate.

00:02:08

Who are the Jews? How is 1 defined as a Jew outside the context of European anti-Semitism?

00:02:15

Does Jewishness have a subjective aspect in addition to its racial components? In other words, how does the Judaism of the Jewish state relate to the traditional or historical Jewish culture or heritage that it claims to represent?

00:02:32

In this in the 2nd chapter, Jacob suggests framing the Zionists claim to Jewish identity as an act of supersessionism, a political theology of replacement where Zionism is seen as taking over the role and place of historical traditional Judaism.

00:02:51

Framing the later as anachronistic or even inauthentic. Nevertheless, the picture is much more complex as Zionism both rebels against and subordinates the Jewish pest.

00:03:03

Negating and appropriating it simultaneously.

00:03:07

Most notably, this ambivalent replacement is evident in the stereo politics of the state, where sovereignty functions as a quasi divine agent that both protects and completes the Jew.

00:03:21

Israeli ambivalence toward the Jewish past is reflected in both its vision of the past and its vision of the future, or, as Yakov calls it in Chapters 3 and 4, nostalgia and redemption.

00:03:34

Through the politics of memory, which are always the politics of forgetting the state, agents of memory can formulate a proper superstitionist approach, or at least attempt to do so. However, these politics of memory as part of the engagement with the negated Jewish past.

00:03:52

Allow the past to speak or to put it another way, enable resistance and call to memory by counter hegemonic groups. Both Misrahi Jews and Palestinians.

00:04:02

Likewise, Zionists of Theology engages with pre state traditions, reframing and appropriating them into the narrative of the sovereign state. A central concept of Zionism, and significantly religious Zionism.

00:04:18

Involves the secularisation of key theological concepts such as the temple redemption and the gathering of the ex.

00:04:26

Keyboard consequently, the state of Israel embodies the fulfilment of the traditional yearning of for Zion, rendering the entirety of Jewish history as Zionist, with the State of Israel representing the apex of that history.

00:04:41

The state is viewed as the temple and the demonstration of sovereignty on the Temple Mount and the entire region signifies redemption.

00:04:50

The book 5th and final chapter outlines, or rather calls for Jewish criticism of Zionism, illustrating Leon Roth's writing on the subject.

00:05:02

By concluding with Jewish criticism, Jacob seems to be conveying something about his own position. A Jewish critic of Zionism, an intimate critic from within.

00:05:15

Therefore, it seemed only natural to invite one of the most influential critics of Zionism, who approaches criticism from a Jewish standpoint.

00:05:24

A teacher and for some friend to discuss them and to discuss the book with jaakov and with us. Amon Raskrakovsky teaches at the Department of Jewish History at Bengali on University of the Negev. He was a fellow at the Berlin Institute of Advanced Studies.

00:05:41

I'm sorry not to say it in German at the Kat Centre for Advanced Judaic Studies in Philadelphia, a visiting professor at the University of Pennsylvania and at the School for Advanced Studies in the Social Sciences in.

00:05:53

Among his many publications, the censor, the editor and the text, Catholic censorship and Hebrew literature in the 16th century, published in the University of Pennsylvania Press in 2007, and Excel also the Intel.

00:06:09

Published by LA Fabric in 2007, an English version version of his recent book in Hebrew Mishna consciousness, biblical consciousness suffered in Zionist culture will come out in Brandeis University Press next year.

00:06:24

And for those of you, for some reason we're not familiar with Yakov. So Yakov Yadgar is a Stanley Lewis professor of Israel studies here at Oxford and a Fellow of St. Annes College. His previous books include sovereign Jews published by State University of New York, W 2017.

00:06:44

And Israel's Jewish identity crisis, published by Cambridge University Press in 2020. Please join me in welcoming both Professor Yaga and Professor Ozkakowski.

00:06:45

I.

00:07:02

Thank.

00:07:03

Do you sound right?

00:07:05

Houston, Houston, please.

00:07:07

No. OK.

00:07:07

I will say a few words. The ID that we have in mind was after this wonderful presentation of David.

00:07:17

Of the entire book and each chapter.

00:07:21

To discuss each some of the chapters, at least separately.

00:07:25

Yes, you know, because the book is full of insight and it's impossible to summarise it. And as you could see, the questions are really questions. So it's better to to to try to think about it and I'm sure.

00:07:41

That we will not complete this conversation as the book in front of us really open.

00:07:49

It proposed amazing new.

00:07:53

Insight, but open new questions to deal with. For me, it's a real honour and I'm very glad of the opportunity to come here and to to participate in this celebration because Yakov was always.

00:08:10

A source of inspiration.

00:08:13

And I was thinking about his insight since his.

00:08:18

First stages when he worked about internal Israeli issues, mainly about traditionalism and the critique of what is secular in Israel.

00:08:31

And but in fact we in the last years, we became much more friends and we partnered for a continuous conversation. I think that things he left to Oxford with our conversation started when he had to leave in order to.

00:08:46

Continue it, but meanwhile.

00:08:48

He published 3 books that this is the third of them I call it. I wouldn't call it a trilogy because I'm sure it's.

00:08:56

Without the deal with the uniqueness of what he called in the 1st of this volume.

00:09:04

Sovereign Jews. What sovereignty is doing here? What is the the role of separatists in the formation of the Jews? Instead of think sovereignty as simply a solution or a problem?

00:09:19

It is something else that he is doing here and since then he really deals in all these three volumes and I.

00:09:32

Will keep only speaking about this one, but it is sometimes impossible. During all these volumes about the real tension between.

00:09:43

Judaism and Israel, I wouldn't say even Zionism here, but the fact that Judaism in Israel has this Zionism there also tells us about the the issue and indeed.

00:09:59

The first.

00:10:02

Question that was raised already in the introduction was the question of exceptionalism and.

00:10:10

And and, Yakub says, both supporters of Israel and its opponents insist sometimes of his exceptionalism. And he insists of thinking about it within the framework of nationalism.

00:10:27

Nation state and to see the cases in which we learn from other cases about Israel.

00:10:36

So but at the same time.

00:10:39

After declaring it the, the book also raised all all the time.

00:10:46

Question of exceptionalism. When you talk about Israel, what is it? The State of Israel? And we are talking now, particularly at the Yakov insist I'm talking about.

00:11:00

State. I'm talking about a nation that was created through this state and this is one of the questions that we will deal, who is the Jewish people? Who is the nation of the nation state?

00:11:15

This is a question it hardly can be found any equivalent elsewhere. Who is the nation behind? There is a distinction between different aspects. I mentioned them and I will go back to the there is the traditional people of Israel.

00:11:31

Which is also not simply ethnic but theological term. The people of Israel, the people of God. It never appears as the people of Israel. It's Israel among his people.

00:11:46

Yes, all its people and there is the Jewish people.

00:11:50

Disinvention of the 19th century.

00:11:53

When?

00:11:55

Great Jewish thinkers and rabbis wrote thought about Israel.

00:12:02

In the 18th century, even they still didn't have Jewish people. It turned the Jewish people.

00:12:09

Emerge as part of being of the Jews being a question.

00:12:16

And again, the question of exceptionality raises here because it is always the Jewish question that a company derives of nationalism.

00:12:31

In Europe.

00:12:33

And the third is the Israeli nation, the Israeli Jewish nation, which is not identical with their with the Jewish people. It's just different, and it is a nation about according to all aspects of nationalism, yes.

00:12:49

And it's diaspora. Maybe in order to clarify it.

00:12:52

Not the Jewish day, after all.

00:12:54

It's the Israeli day of.

00:12:55

Yes, those who wake up in the morning and open the news site from Israel and want to know what happened yesterday in, in the soccer game, et cetera, et cetera. And they have their own language and they speak Hebrew, of course, and they speak the, the, the, the new Hebrew. So the question is.

00:13:16

What is it? Well, when there's another thing and he not put. Perhaps even more when I come here and I think, OK, there is.

00:13:24

Israel studies the study of ancient Israel and what is the connection and can you speak about Israel without Christian Zionism? And can, when we speak about nationalism, I always I think about my colleague.

00:13:40

Ethan Barr Yousef who?

00:13:43

Loses dissertation here. Who studied in Oxford and published his book about England and the Holy Land in the 19th century in Oxford University Press.

00:13:55

Many years ago I don't remember, but who deals about the intervention? So nationalism itself?

00:14:02

Cannot. You can think about nationalism without the Bible, which means which for some makes the Jewish.

00:14:11

Acceptance of the Bible.

00:14:15

As previously, well, that's there. But in fact, as we know it makes it more complicated because Judaism is not the Bible, but maybe we will talk about it when we talk about supersessionism.

00:14:29

So.

00:14:32

First of all, thank you for coming. Thank you for the introduction. Thank you, rono.

00:14:36

Doing this.

00:14:39

I think the distinction between the particular and the universal, the case and the script that it plays out is essential for understanding.

00:14:49

Well, the case at hand and the wider framework, it goes without saying that we live in an era which I would describe as a resurgent.

00:14:59

Nation statism.

00:15:01

If you want to understand at least parts of part of what you know, the first quarter of the 20th 21st century is about, I think it's impossible to ignore that it is a resurgent nation, statism in which, again, you could see Israel sometimes.

00:15:17

Playing out.

00:15:19

A script or a move within a script that other nations other stages follow later, not because Israel sets such an example only because they all play the same script. And on this level I'm very happy to unsettle those who would want to study Israel as a unique and.

00:15:36

Umm.

00:15:37

Unprecedented and standing in it, you know, in itself for itself, case it is not. There are many similarities in the way that the underlying script plays itself. And just to give one example, no, no, you mentioned this complicated relationship between the state and and the nation.

00:15:57

One author that I don't mention in the book work that I read after completing the book is by is a series of lectures by Pierre Bourdier on the state.

00:16:09

In the College of funds, and I haven't read it before writing the book, I should have should have and I haven't. And one of the first things that this French sociologist

speaking to his audience in the coalition of France has to stress and highlight is that it's a myth to think that the society precedes the state the state creates the society.

00:16:28

So that's that's on the universal level and yes and the.

00:16:32

You know, they're much to be said. There is much to be said.

00:16:35

How?

00:16:36

The history of design is enterprise, which culminates in the establishment of the of the State of Israel. It's a history that starts with an.

00:16:46

Developed in.

00:16:49

An enterprise, a political project and culminates in a state which then later afterwards receives its nation which it builds, or it will receive its population which it's which it builds.

00:17:02

As a nation, having said that, it's very important to also unsettle those who to unsettle those who do not see the uniqueness of the Jewishness of the playing out of those scripts. There is no other state in the world that sees itself as the state of the Jews and the Jewish state.

00:17:17

There is no other state that sees itself as committed to translating or not translating, adapting, interpreting as any script demands.

00:17:26

This nation state is logic into the history of Jews or the nation statism of Jews or whatever you want. So it found it finds itself.

00:17:38

Forced into a discussion with a claim to Judaism that some of its founders didn't really want to have, they thought of themselves as as having overcome Judaism.

00:17:52

I find this tension to be.

00:17:54

Essential for understanding the state of Israel, and I hope that when we get to the, you know what I have to say more normatively in the conclusion, we can see how the Jewish case also sheds light on what other states, other nations that can think of themselves as a way to overcome some of the of the maladies of this nation state.

00:18:13

Yeah, the last sentence I will.

00:18:16

I will more than agree even because I I I even just to insist that you can't think about.

00:18:25

Israel.

00:18:26

Without thinking of the rule.

00:18:31

Still, the exception of the rule when you say that there is no other Jewish state but the state because the the state itself was formed through biblical images. Yes, yes. Hopes. Leviathan. Yes, yes. When? I mean when the. When the Bible is considered as so crucial.

00:18:51

I mean to think about it, I I I do agree and perhaps we will come to it immediately when we talk about Super Sessioning how to to, to to it is impossible to criticise Israel without.

00:19:03

We don't working on different way I.

00:19:06

I did. I'm not.

00:19:07

Yeah. Another thing that I learned recently and this was from Nono himself, which I you know I haven't developed fully in the book, which obviously sheds light on this discussion is that when we do describe or when do we do refer to Jewish.

00:19:23

Identity or Jewish people or Jewish collectivities?

00:19:28

What is being formed in Israel is the Jewish people, or Judaism or Jewishness, and what is being formed or viewed as Judaism and Jewishness outside of Israel?

00:19:39

If not.

00:19:39

More and more 2 distinct.

00:19:41

Yeah.

00:19:42

Features and I would like you to kind of, you know kind of because I don't want to be rephrase.

00:19:48

How do you see this playing out with with relation to sovereignty?

00:19:53

The Israeli Judaism, the Israeli Jewishness.

00:19:56

No, I let's wait with let's wait with that. Leave me alone for a minute.

00:20:00

OK.

00:20:05

Fair enough. Fair enough.

00:20:06

You know you don't want me to start speaking about about about, OK, there is enough to stay here yet. But you of course it continues with the conversation because.

00:20:16

So.

00:20:16

We don't want to to. We want to go to the first. We're still in the production of the book. Yes, we're still dealing with the introduction with the question it raises. And then you come with the first introduction, the 1st chapter that makes it.

00:20:31

That answer your question maybe.

00:20:34

The distinction.

00:20:36

Between.

00:20:38

Jewish state, yes, and Jews state yes. What is the the Jewish state and the Jew state? Which maybe?

00:20:48

Want to elaborate?

00:20:49

Yeah. So first of all, and I think some of this should be rather trivial and obvious, but at the same time, when you start poking at it, you see that it's much more complicated.

00:21:00

Then might seem at first sight, and writing this chapter has been an interesting exercise of trying to explicate some that is taken for granted, and then the very exercise of justice mentioning it can be sometimes unsettling and sometimes again sound a little bit.

00:21:04

I.

00:21:16

So you know, So what are you trying to to say that is not already discussed before?

00:21:23

My argument basically is that there are two political visions that are entailed in different understanding of Jewish identity.

00:21:30

There is what I would call a biological or demographic or ethnic or racial or whatever you want to describe it. They sense that the Jew and the term would be dead, Jew. A Jew right precedes anything that is to be considered as Jewish.

00:21:49

Jewish creations, Jewish tradition. Jewish history to be a Jew is a matter of the accident of birth.

00:21:55

So the politics that emerges from that kind of politics is what, again, no, no, we have to give the credit to the teachers sitting here. Nono has when I was just a young student already phrased as this vision of Israel as a Jewish and demographic state.

00:22:14

It's a state that is obsessed about the issue of the.

00:22:19

Necessity imbalance between a majority of Jews and a minority of non Jews.

00:22:25

It's a politics that is enabled by this majoritarian notion, in which context, anything that this group can do would be considered Jewish. I think if considered against the background of Jewish history, that's a complete novelty, and some would say even a heresy of the concept of Jewishness.

00:22:43

In any event, this has been the rally.

00:22:48

Of liberal, secular Zionism, this is where it really gets interesting to see that it is the left, the liberal, the small in Israel that adheres to this demographic anxiety more than any other party.

00:23:03

In the group there's an alternative view which in the background of design is the idea we can identify with a hadam, not a non Zionist, not an anti Zionist in any in any way, not the non secularist, the secularist, through and through in in his own self identity.

00:23:19

But a view that sees Jewishness as.

00:23:24

Or Judaism or Jewish history is preceded this accident of birth. Anyone can become Jewish. It doesn't have to do with blood. This accident of birth might enable you better access to it through education through.

00:23:38

Habitus if you want to stick to bridges, but what's essential here is that Judaism is a teaching. This is what the meaning of Torah is. Anyone can.

00:23:50

Learn this teaching and the matter of.

00:23:53

Face or blood or ethnicity is completely secondary, but it is a judgmental.

00:23:59

It's a it's a normative view. You can say on something. This is Jewish. This is not Jewish.

00:24:06

Politics derived from this view.

00:24:09

Would demand of the state to adhere to a series of, well, normative colleagues.

00:24:16

Now to add to that, I would insist, yes, that there is another level which I do not attend to in the chapter, which is what you mentioned in your other work that the very notion of Jewishness itself is where differently within the political context of a nation state.

00:24:32

And what the nation states, called its diaspora, the Jewish diaspora.

00:24:38

But I will continue in a few seconds again. OK, so you.

00:24:46

We are clarified. You go back to two founders of Zionism, yes, Herzl and Saddam. Yes, Herzl. Political Zionism. The question is the enemy. What makes the Jews the nation is the enemy.

00:25:00

What made it also again another aspect of exceptionalism after the Holocaust. It is anti-Semitism.

00:25:09

And interestingly, when a.

00:25:12

Known author wrote a book that was immediately suppressed in Israel. He about Zionist attitudes, Zionist work.

00:25:24

Attempts, even and world court during the Nazi period. He called it post Ugandan the post Ugandan Zionism, and its attitude towards the Jews. In other words, take a hat for him.

00:25:42

The abandonment of a healthy view that this is the issue. This is post Uganda, Uganda was the case when.

00:25:55

The Rusty Semper offered the Jews allegedly offered.

00:25:59

Another solution in Africa and the Zionist health and supported it, but it was totally refused by the Zionist Congress and led to the immigration of the left Wing Zionists.

00:26:16

To Palestine, this is also interesting because it was the left wing who insisted there is no Zionism but in Zion, in the land of Israel. It's not the issue if we think about it today.

00:26:31

It tend to be the.

00:26:34

Israeli secular.

00:26:36

Have to define themselves, and they're linked to to Judaism. They were Judaism as a tradition.

00:26:44

Is not part of the world Auschwitz and it's commemoration is crucial aspect in their education and it turned even this year, I mean after.

00:26:58

October 7 when, because after all, we have to remember, we are talking about.

00:27:03

A crisis that started before October seven. I mean, we're talking about a state that is in crisis, which we don't know how to identify him today because the world is the entire world is in crisis. What? What they, what does it mean only.

00:27:18

Israel with with President Trump, but I think.

00:27:26

There was suddenly people expressed after two or three weeks.

00:27:32

After October seven, a kind of relief. We are united again. Yes, we have an enemy, yes.

00:27:38

We will have problems. They believe that it will solve the double well, they will go wrong. Yes, but they believe. But it was declared again and again in the in TV programmes in many places, yes, we have an enemy now. Now we are all united.

00:27:54

Now we know what it is. That's it. It is over.

00:27:58

It might be also worth mentioning that the thing that they viewed as potentially tearing them apart on the eve of that holiday, right? It was the holiday season.

00:28:09

Where exactly issues of the very nature of the public sphere as a Jewish public sphere?

00:28:14

Totally, as there is no, exactly because this is the Israel of the last 20 years, I think since since 2006.

00:28:25

The the the since the government of Barack.

00:28:31

Since then, the the idea is that there is no solution to the Palestinian don't forget, Palestinians are not a minority in the land. Yes, Palestinian minority among the citizens of Israel. Yes, it's important to to remember the the the question of talking about a Palestinian minority.

00:28:50

Exclusively.

00:28:53

Was part of this blindness of this of this total denial, in order to repeat this?

00:29:01

And what you call in the in the next chapter. Nostalgia. Yes, a kind of a white Jewish landscape. Yes, a type of it is an ostalgia fate immediately.

00:29:18

An ottarget to the utopians, yes, there it's not in Uttar Gate to any moment in the past.

00:29:24

But it is a nostalgia to desire an ethiopias. There is nothing in between these nostalgia and it also, of course, a nostalgia of the Ashkenazi elite.

00:29:35

But before we go there, you just you, you.

00:29:38

I want to make a point and just to to highlight something here. First, the point to make is that this book was written and finalised before the outbreak of the war and it doesn't touch it doesn't even mention it in the preface. This is it's not about the.

00:29:39

OK.

00:29:47

Yeah.

00:29:51

War. But one thing that we've seen.

00:29:56

Overtaking much of the public debate in Israel and specifically outside of Israel since the outbreak of the war, the stock of anti-Semitism and the problem of the conflation of anti-Semitism and.

00:30:08

Can be viewed as a necessary outcome of the construction of Jewish identity on.

00:30:15

Impetus of the other of the hater which hurts her. This is fascinating to see, and I mean, I write on this specifically in the book, when Herzl addresses the Zionist Congress and titles the the lecture you didn't.

00:30:30

So Judaism or jewellery, it's not exactly. I mean the term would translate differently. It doesn't say anything about Judaism. It says what unites us is the enemy. Yeah, he would agree with sort. We'll say later on Jews don't have a history, don't have a territory, don't have a religion. They basically outside of history.

00:30:47

The politicisation of them would bring them into history.

00:30:51

Having hall construction of identity that is fed by hatred.

00:30:58

Needs the hatred to sustain.

00:31:01

And it's fascinating to see how this is sometimes how, you know, some what kind of how would I say monsters it can.

00:31:09

Yeah. OK.

00:31:13

About anti-Semitism first, yes we have to deal with it now as a global question, yes I mean.

00:31:21

How we are dealing with Israel in a framework in which the post USSR, let's say or after the unification of and the unification of Germany.

00:31:33

A anti scientism was distinguished for any other kind of racism and cannot be.

00:31:41

Compared it tend to be one of the one of the essential aspects of of of the Western. I don't know what will happen to it now.

00:31:53

With Trump and Gaza between Trump and Gaza, I don't know, but it is.

00:31:59

There and you mentioned it when you talked about El Abdoth work against.

00:32:05

Yes, they.

00:32:06

Not against anti anti anti-Semitism yes there is anti-Semitism. There is anti anti-Semitism and he proposed the anti anti anti-Semitism in order to normalise the discussion. Yes you know that he in order to fight for himself.

00:32:06

Are I mean?

00:32:24

A place as a Jew.

00:32:26

We're going back to the question. I don't want to be within the mural of starter and I and then State of Israel is of course.

00:32:35

Not as normal, because health and state.

00:32:38

Was a European state. There is the Jewish thing. There is a secular right synagogue. Yes, it's a. It's a Jewish church. Yes. Yes, it's a Jewish.

00:32:49

You can say that synagogue in church are identical elements religion mentioned, but of course have to believe that the Israelis will speak German, not Hebrew. On the other hand, about the other opinion of hadam.

00:33:05

Yeah.

00:33:05

Who suggested Jewish culture should remember that for religious people it was easier to identify with herself and not with a hadam with this problematic concept, what is the Jewish culture?

00:33:21

Which is almost identical with what is Jewish nation that you go back is at the end.

00:33:27

There is no Jewish National History. Yes, that's the point I'm teaching in the Department of the History of the Jewish people, something that does not have exist. There is no, I mean, from our perspective, from the modern perspective, you can make such a film.

00:33:44

By comparing different Jewish communities that live in the past and make sense of the of the comparative discussion. But it doesn't mean the Jews of they have a history.

00:33:57

The first Jewish history was not accidentally written by Peter.

00:34:02

Jacques Banaj de Beauvell in the 18th century.

00:34:05

It's another aspect of the.

00:34:07

Question. So anti-Semitism is also an important angle to which to consider. The very idea of superstitionism and then the complicated exercise of applying that concept to Zionism.

00:34:21

Yeah, because first it touches upon this very again, unsettling and sometimes, you know, completely controversial provocation of suggesting that Zionism feeds on anti-Semitic notions to build itself. But.

00:34:37

My whole exercise there.

00:34:40

Is to highlight, not necessarily this.

00:34:44

This indebtedness to European anti Jewish thinking but more the indebtedness to the idea of overcoming Judaism.

00:34:54

Or.

00:34:57

As well as your work suggests, adopting the Christian ambivalence to Judaism.

00:35:03

Yes, and this is important. I mean, because this is a also a debate with David Nierenberg's anti Judaism. When he tried to discuss anti Judaism as essential romanticity something.

00:35:18

Essential including Islam and Christianity to take it out.

00:35:21

Of the broader.

00:35:24

Obviously Christian discussion, which cannot be.

00:35:28

Summarised as anti-Semitism, it will be meaningless, yes. So if because then you say, OK, Christianity is identity count 2 anti.

00:35:40

OK, this is a view you will hear in several Orthodox groups.

00:35:46

But it leaves it doesn't lead us to any analytical understanding of anything.

00:35:51

And this so this relation so supersessionism is a nice title to say the idea that one sees oneself and this is a collective oneself as.

00:36:04

Not necessarily. Having replaced the other, but actually appropriated and making a claim to the authenticity of the art.

00:36:13

So in the frame of Christian theology, it's the argument that the churches the church would say, you know, like on first level it would say the church has replaced Israel, Israel, the people, the people of the Bible, the chosen nation. But then.

00:36:28

We would say well, it's not really replaced because it as always it has always been the authentic Israel and those, you know, people who call themselves Jews or Israelites, whatever they are just a mistake in in, in a way.

00:36:42

This framework of appropriation indication.

00:36:46

Which as a Brian Wilbrah.

00:36:53

Brilliantly demonstrated, first of all shows us how difficult it is to come to terms with Christian Zionism.

00:37:00

Because Christian Zionism is built on this premise of appropriation and negation. But then when you think who appropriates what from whom, the picture becomes much more complicated. First is the issue of the indepthness of design.

00:37:15

Enterprise from the get go to non Jewish thinkers who were calling to the restoration of the Jewish people in its land.

00:37:24

Shalom Godman celebrates this as the necessity to expand our understanding of Zionism to include Christians or non Jews within this framework. But then there is this problematic notion of.

00:37:39

Negation, and if there's one work in the history of Israeli.

00:37:44

Political culture, when Zionism that anyone should read and mostly read, is known as work or on the negation of exile, the negation of exile, not as an exercise of saying exile, was where it didn't go well, and we have to go and politicise ourselves.

00:38:02

But exile as well, I guess three different things.

00:38:06

Which are negated in different ways, right? This exile is being outside, outside.

00:38:11

Learn the physical dispersion diaspora, which is to be redeemed by the self in gathering of eggs. Right. Not but not by waiting for God to bring us together does.

00:38:26

Political notion of exile, which Zionism I think, highlights most of anything else. Exile as the status of lacking sovereignty as being a minority among other people who rule us. So the empty. This is what drives the whole the whole Herculean project, right. We will rule ourselves.

00:38:46

And then there's this deepest and most interesting and most theologically challenging of all, the notion of exile is what I would call in Hebrew Ester panim the.

00:38:57

Yeah.

00:39:00

How would you call it in English? I'm not even sure the theological understanding of it, which your work has expanded.

00:39:05

Maybe.

00:39:08

No, I was trying to say something about about exile. Yes, indeed. The a topic that occupy me for the last, I think, 40 years.

00:39:21

And I don't you can't make progress when you talk about exile because we always have exile and you don't have to. You can solve the problem of what is exile.

00:39:26

Feel.

00:39:31

But I think it's crucial.

00:39:32

Indeed, for the your discussion of.

00:39:36

Version I think that first of all we have to clarify here what Yaakov observed.

00:39:40

The dynast attitude toward the.

00:39:45

Is following the Christian superstitionism. Yes, there is. They all Jew and the new Jew. The new emancipated, the new liberated Jew. There is the exilic. Jew is always stubborn, like in and blind.

00:40:04

Like in the Christian perceptions of Jews in the Middle Ages, yes, and Zionist is something else. There is the all the issues in the land of Israel.

00:40:16

The religious issue.

00:40:19

And.

00:40:20

And they speak only about the Ashkenazi, without mentioning the sopharody larger community.

00:40:27

And there is the new issue of our community. European enlightened, liberated from the law because this is crucially for for the secular divers and liberated from tradition for everybody. So this is indeed.

00:40:47

One aspect of this.

00:40:48

Brilliant understanding of Zionism in Christian terms. Yeah, you need it. And then you integrate into the West. You go back also to Hartzell, it's not Jews as they are.

00:41:01

There is Impedent wanted to to find a solution for the Jews as they are. He wanted to transform the Jews. She wanted to convert the Jews. I will insist to me. And now what is Jewish and understanding?

00:41:18

Superstition.

00:41:19

I mean because of super fashion is indeed the Christian ambivalence towards the Jews. It is the truth that was replaced by a higher truth. Yes, there is a truth. That's the difference between it's not total denial.

00:41:35

You can't deny it's a truth that was replaced, and there is a Old Testament and a new one. Yes, like the old Jew and the new Jew. Yes, the paulinian Jew. For the Jews. The response.

00:41:50

We'll take that.

00:41:52

That's exactly the notion of exile, and it was.

00:41:57

Formed and I'm following here.

00:42:02

Israel, lack of uval analysis of the path of Aragata when he regard the Passover hagadda as a counter Christian text. So we used to see Christianity as coming from Judaism.

00:42:15

Yuval tells us no, it's not exactly. It's the good thing that we know the the post destruction Judaism, the Post second Temple, Judaism, the Jews, and that we know.

00:42:30

Was indeed established as a response to the catastrophe, to the destruction of the temple, but also in response to the new interpretation, the Easter. So instead of Easter, which is the manifestation of Supersessionism, yes.

00:42:48

The second revelation.

00:42:50

The Jews insist no, we are the hour of freedom is also here in exile. There is nothing we are still in the same situation of the first revelation of the Sain.

00:43:06

Ts and our exile is the manifestation of the world itself. And now what's raised from your question now, from your analysis, when I take my language back to your book.

00:43:21

And also the question of exceptionality is how to reestablish this counter Jewish perception a VIS a VIS not Christianity, but Zionism.

00:43:35

And these and the Jewish voices that emerge that cannot be suppressed because negation of exile was unsuccessful to a certain extent.

00:43:45

Yes, and and I and I conclude the discussion in this chapter with the, I guess I I'm I'm doing the reader's work and I ask So what? So what what's the merit of you know of this analysis, what what do we gain from?

00:43:59

You know, applying this perspective and I think it all comes down to the question of Judaism. So what, what is the shape of Judaism in light of this dominance? And this is again something that Nono has said different times in different ways. And I just you

know, I'm happy to repeat that there is no way of understanding Judaism nowadays without.

00:44:19

Referring to the the state of Israel as claiming that Jewish identity.

00:44:26

There are, I guess those fringe groups that define the Jewishness.

00:44:31

As the negation of the state. But as you said, they're fringe and they're not. They don't necessarily offer something constructive. It's much more interesting to see two things which.

00:44:41

Which for me are you know.

00:44:44

The A revelation of soil one is to see how secular Israeli identity.

00:44:52

Is.

00:44:53

Haunted.

00:44:55

By the fear of what Sholem in the letter that Nonno has discussed so brilliantly on Thursday.

00:45:04

What sholy described as the volcano.

00:45:07

Of the theological religious essence of this identity that they reclaim.

00:45:14

All appropriate I would say not fulfilling appropriate, so this fear of Judaism within second Israeli identity as a motivating force is just brilliant to see.

00:45:25

Whatever you, you know, whatever your judgement of it would be. The second is to see those who.

00:45:33

Confront that appropriation.

00:45:37

Do not agree with.

00:45:39

But don't choose negation, but rather I would say adaptation reinterpretation.

00:45:47

The most the example I bring in the book is of the famous.

00:45:53

Speech by Derry Arie, Derry on the eve of the election when he was.

00:45:59

When he was indicted just about to go to gaol or to trial, I don't know which one. Right? This is 1996.

00:46:05

1999 nineteen.

00:46:07

99 I'm sorry, 1999. I'm sorry. 1999 in front of a big crowd in a sports stadium claiming very forcefully. We are the real Zionists. We do not the gay Zionism, but our Zionism is the real one. And the way that theologically speaking.

00:46:09

I was there.

00:46:27

Yourself is dealt with this.

00:46:30

So in Safari, the synagogues in Israel, right, we don't say a blessing for the state. We don't elevate the state into a theological level.

00:46:43

But we do pray for the safety of the soldiers because of all of our kids are in service in service basically.

00:46:49

Yeah, maybe I can take a day and first of all, because you've mentioned this shock movement.

00:46:57

And Rabbi Ovadia and I think that perhaps about Rabbi Ovadia will speak when we come to this, your discussion about redemption in a minute, yes, because we follow the narrative we should.

00:47:09

We should.

00:47:11

Later, we should yes.

00:47:12

We.

00:47:13

Should what do you mean?

00:47:14

Time time. How much time you have?

00:47:17

No. OK, you have to. We don't even up for your.

00:47:23

And and dairy in this speech.

00:47:27

In front of.

00:47:30

Thousands of Ultra Orthodox people.

00:47:34

Insisted to speak for 8 minutes about the need for equality to the Arab citizens of Israel. It was before 2000, before Barack the Liberals were occupied only with.

00:47:51

Corruption.

00:47:53

But while arresting him, they prevented this ideal of someone who, ultra orthodox, who insisted on taking responsibility as a minister. And in this he this was something very different.

00:48:11

From Ultra Orthodox policies until today, the Ultra Orthodox, the government, the they are in the government, but they are not ministers. I mean ridiculous, yes.

00:48:23

And dairy insisted on that and that what I.

00:48:29

Shocked then is the need.

00:48:32

He talks to people, nobody. He will not get credit for it, but he will insisted to speak of it as if part of his issue. It's part of.

00:48:46

I think what the the, the the legacy of Reba Ovadia.

00:48:50

That on, let's say, religious.

00:48:57

Patriotic. I would not call him Zionist because perhaps he would not like it. Yes, but patriotic.

00:49:05

Considerations.

00:49:08

Rejected.

00:49:10

The the, the, the, the, the. Regardless, Israel is redemption. And here we come to the other issue. Israel has a the redemption embedded in Israel and the way the perception of redemption.

00:49:25

Leads to destruction. Yes. Yes, almost. Yeah. Yes.

00:49:30

So the, you know Shas and the phenomena that it represents this.

00:49:37

Often neglected majority of Jews within Israeli society who are not Ashkenazim and present a different approach to Zionism and to Jewish history and to Jewish tradition also lead us to this issue of the Israeli and Jewish past, which is the which is discussed under the headline in in of of nostalgia.

00:49:56

One of the one of the fascinating feature of Israeli identity.

00:50:04

Is that it has no.

00:50:07

Prior to 1948, there's no land of Israel or Palestinian. If you would like to call history to which that identity makes a claim.

00:50:18

Notice that way the latest book on Suffolk, for example, shows this brilliant history, brilliant history, the brilliance of history of 16th century suffered and and and well relevant other errors surrounding it which is completely ignored.

00:50:35

By this kind of identity, it it makes sense if you consider the Super sessionist view. If you have overcome an identity.

00:50:43

You don't make a claim to its history, so Jewish history is a problem because it's an exilic history. It's a history of religion. It's a if you, you know, if you follow many of the Hegelian Zionist, it is not history just were outside of history.

00:50:58

Israel or Palestine. Palestine history. Palestine is the country is in, is not available.

00:51:05

And at the same time you see yourself as committed to the nationalist worldview that you have finally arrived home.

00:51:15

While this entails an emigre, you know immigration and immigration and uprooting and resettling, this creates a fascinating tension. And it's.

00:51:26

It's a very helpful key to use to understand Israeli identity, to consider which are the nostalgia any society has nostalgia. What is it that Israelis are yearn for, or what is it that different groups within Israeli society?

00:51:43

Yearn for?

00:51:44

And this distinction between an Ashkenazi nostalgia to the good old land of Israel.

00:51:50

Which is encapsulated in a in a soundscape in a vision of.

00:51:59

Pre State Palestine or Arab Israel and of Israel territory.

00:52:04

I.

00:52:04

Devoid of the two others, devoid of Palestinians and devoid of Mizrahim.

00:52:10

Where everything was wonderful and great, so the nostalgia says, contrasted with Mizrahi nostalgia. First of all, USF, if you mentioned it, Al Azira taralius, now with the returning of its ground to the Glory, famously this can be read differently. And apparently ovadia yourself from what I read, had different ideas, but obviously his audience read it.

00:52:32

I mean we sephardine. We Miss Rahim had a glorious history to which we want to return. Not in Israel, not in Palestine, among other nations.

00:52:47

And what Avishai Margalit, whom I used to kind of move the discussion forward, describes as as a negative nostalgia of Mizoram. Who says, you know, we want to go back to the good old times in our countries before you ask.

00:53:05

Subjugated us into this. It's interesting to see how this this two nostalgias again, the are nostalgia. They're not historical constructs. We can't put them into, you know, under the.

00:53:16

Sculpture of historical analysis or even a political analysis. But as nostalgia, they present 2 contradictory horizons for.

00:53:26

One eliminatory wanting to be alone, separate and fuel from others, and the other hoping for coudiencia for living together in a in a shared.

00:53:37

Of so.

00:53:37

No, but unfortunately, yeah, it almost disappeared. Yes. And the elimination aspect of Israeli policy tend to be.

00:53:47

Growing more and more. Yes. So I think that we are coming. It is also the moment in which it is clear.

00:53:55

That you can speak about Israel.

00:53:58

Without speaking about Palestine.

00:54:00

Because otherwise you go to your last chapter, yeah.

00:54:04

To the temple Mount.

00:54:05

Yes to the temple now and you can think and about about it and this is indeed the distinction between religious Zionism.

00:54:15

Generally, although there is a debate there because many, many extremists also refuse to go to the Temple mount yes for their own reasons, but without.

00:54:26

Without the theological depth or that you will find in in this attitude, yes, they simply refuse. But they want sovereignty all over the land, including the the temple mounts itself, denying any.

00:54:41

Denying Palestinians existence and the the, and unfortunately, this nostalgia did the.

00:54:50

Arab Jewish path.

00:54:53

Was replaced by.

00:54:56

Re telling the history of Jews in Muslim lands.

00:55:02

As history of persecution, I mean the lakim of.

00:55:09

According to the lakrimus perception, famous phrase of against the Latin of the Crouch to Jewish history, Jewish history, not Latimer. Interestingly, and it was written 100 years ago, Salo Baron.

00:55:25

Interestingly, it turned to be again a lachrymosian.

00:55:30

History of the the Arab and the need of the Mizrahi.

00:55:36

From the Palestinians because it's not the two others of Israel.

00:55:41

Yes.

00:55:42

You can't talk about with Rahim and a Palestinian because, as you say, as you show in.

00:55:48

In this chapter, I think indeed the difference between those who should be integrated through the denial of their culture, the misahem and those who are permanently excluded, and from the history of the land, yes, the Palestinians.

00:56:06

And.

00:56:06

So it is this complicated Mizrahi attitude today that can bring us back to to this what you mentioned about the celebration. The Rabbi, Rabbi Ovadia Yosef.

00:56:22

Understanding and this is important because Zionism consider accept in fact, the perception of Zionism as redemption, and that and that what leads to the.

00:56:36

To the deterioration.

00:56:38

Ation because what you show in the.

00:56:41

Is that the temp? As long as you see the entire country as liberated?

00:56:48

The attitude to the Temple Mountain to be stronger. Even, yes. And they did not demand to to raise, namely to to destroy.

00:57:00

There the current.

00:57:03

Month of the resource of Amsterd instead of Haram strip even near Haram Sharif and the.

00:57:09

Of the rock.

00:57:11

Yes. So this is the attention that you clarifying the last chapter of your book that brings us again to think penultimate about the exceptionality of Israel because it is there because it's it's the moment in which when talks about the catastrophe inherent in the.

00:57:32

He talks about that. It leaves to that. It leads to the denial. And then you have to ask yourself so, OK, what is the alternative? How can you propose a Jewish?

00:57:45

Alternative, a Jewish Israeli alternative, which is based first on recognition on of Palestinians as precondition to deal with messianism as pre it's it's not. Now I'm talking about it as a precondition for the discussion.

00:58:04

Of the Jews of the Future of Israel that you that you raised.

00:58:08

So I think one of the interesting.

00:58:12

Implications of this black primose view of Jewish history, or the view of Jewish history, is a series of catastrophes that, obviously.

00:58:20

In the Nazi genocide.

00:58:22

The Holocaust during the Second World War and then brings about the establishment of what common powerlings in Israel refers to. It is the third temple.

00:58:36

Entails much of the tensions of what we are discussing here. First of all, it's a temple that is considered to be secular. For some reason. This whole theological discussion. And then we say, but it's a circular construct. But then if you consider the precedence

and you consider a history of destruction and catastrophes, and then you say and we're sitting on the on top of this.

00:58:56

This again.

00:58:57

Trying to be normal like you obviously realise that there's something unsettling.

00:59:03

The the continuous references to the imminent destruction, complete destruction of the polity is a necessary.

00:59:13

Conclusion of that that kind of view. There's nothing normal in the Third Temple, even though the the temple is built, the state is temple, right? It is built in the name of normalising the.

00:59:30

An I'm looking at a time and I think maybe maybe we should just make a because this was this was the penalty mode and I just want to bring into the discussion that neglected and forgotten.

00:59:34

Seen about 10 minutes.

00:59:43

Point of view the Cleon Roth has equated us.

00:59:48

Of.

00:59:49

A Jewish critique of the State of Israel and of Zion.

00:59:54

That is what's committed to Zionism.

00:59:57

It is essentially fed by the Zionist impetus is committed to Judaism, but it is also, I would say, unfortunately.

01:00:07

Unable to break away from the commitment to the nation's state mind mindset.

01:00:15

The question whether it's necessary in the question whether.

01:00:20

Yes.

01:00:23

You left to uphold and you tried to find, perhaps learn Ros. Leon Ross is exceptional figure, I think I mean.

01:00:30

Don't know.

01:00:31

Who knows about Leon Roth today, but for me, Leon Roth, I knew him as the translator.

01:00:38

Of Hobbes, Leviathan has the book.

01:00:41

And.

01:00:42

To realise only when I got there the English version that.

01:00:47

Not host.

01:00:48

The Vietnam, it's part of Hobbs, the Vietnam.

01:00:52

AM.

01:00:55

Has no theological aspects.

01:00:57

No, I mean it's.

01:00:58

Interesting that already there at the Hebrew University and the.

01:01:02

The translation I still think I have a copy. We didn't understand anything because of the on you had to read it in English. So now now we have better translation of. But it was impossible to understand you need.

01:01:18

Explanation for the Hebrew of Leon Roth who wanted.

01:01:22

To settle Hobbs.

01:01:25

In Israel, only the first picture.

01:01:29

Only the first two chapters, which I think is fascinating. What I mean is identical to show them understanding of the volcano. Almost yes. If I continue translating.

01:01:43

If I continue translating, we really have to re ask what is the State of Israel within this framework of discussion of sovereignty, emerge and and the and the central state emerge by home and then.

01:01:59

Yeah, like many other.

01:02:01

Who couldn't stand the the they fought for independence. Never thought that the British will leave. Yes, I mean that was too much for them, I think. And and then they leave. And they propose other Judaism.

01:02:17

And they raised the questions of Zionism I think that that so the last chapter is indeed Zionism from this interesting perspective.

01:02:29

And Michael, I I, I would ask you how how Ross helps us now. For me it was similar to it's it's part of the discussion that takes now you you mentioned exile in the Aspira it is kind of.

01:02:46

A exchange between me and Daniel Boyarin, who wrote the book.

01:02:50

No state option. There is a no state option and you can say Hallelujah. There isn't no state option, but there is a state yes, and you have to take responsibility for this state and without any notion of responsibility.

01:03:07

To everything this state is doing and this state is doing horrible sick and leave itself on my opinion to its own destruction, and this is also the conclusion.

01:03:17

To me, I think of Yakov's book. I mean, it's a kind of anxiety that is exist in all the pages of of of the book attempt at normalising.

01:03:31

And again, that's what I found all the time. It is the attempt of normalising it. It is to say, listen, we have to analyse it within a general framework and at the same time.

01:03:43

When we are not, when we do that, we open questions that cannot be raised.

01:03:50

In any other context, and including immigrants from.

01:03:58

State because.

01:04:01

As if did he went back to the Jewish community, the non Zionist or?

01:04:07

Yes.

01:04:08

Or again, he he came.

01:04:13

Postalon is too, yes, so.

01:04:15

So first of all, it's it's fascinating to think of Roth in light of the of example, because they do emerge from the same time they both established the Hebrew University in Jerusalem, both left.

01:04:30

England in 1928 to establish the most Zionist thing to do at the time to establish the philosophy department in the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. But and like Jolene, has.

01:04:43

Deep and severe misgivings about the conduct of Zionist politics in Palestine and then later on, after the establishment of the State of Israel, but unlike.

01:04:55

Shalom. He refuses to accept the position that well. We need it since since 19 since the Holocaust, we have to carry on with the real politics of of the state. And this is where the responsibility comes into place.

01:05:09

Real worth does not become an anti Zionist Jew.

01:05:11

No, when he didn't even went to preach alone to support by Nazis. Exactly.

01:05:17

It was not, you know, it would always be kind of, you know.

01:05:22

A satellite member of these organisations, but never part of them. But he leaves Israel when it is already Israel. So after just imagine that that ideological mindset after the establishment of 1951, he leaves it, he comes back.

01:05:38

To England, he doesn't leave much of.

01:05:44

Political doctrine to follow, but it has to important things once he leaves Israel first, he sits down to write Jewish writings the most. I think brilliant of which is.

01:05:59

Judaism, a portrait he takes upon himself to write a short book about what Judaism is all about.

01:06:03

Where we insisted that it's Judaism. It's the teaching that makes this Jew and not the other way around. He speaks directly against those. This notion of being a chosen nation as being somehow elected and then better than other people.

01:06:18

I insist that being a chosen nation means.

01:06:20

Responsibility, duty, burden of the chosen and this leads him.

01:06:28

To another kind of intervention of Jewish critique of Israeli politics once they are in play. And I think with this, maybe I should end I I guess the only.

01:06:41

The only quote I would like I would like to read from the.

01:06:45

Is a quote from his. I think Frank. Well, not famous, but highly, highly important letter.

01:06:49

I.

01:06:53

To the Jewish chronicle.

01:06:57

Following the the Kiba massacre, so we tallied to be military Act of Israel against Palestinians in then Jordanian West Bank following following an atrocity.

01:07:12

By Palestinians in Israel.

01:07:16

Where Roth reacts to the Board of Deputies position that you can't critique Israel. It's it's double standard.

01:07:24

Standards, they said, to criticise Israel.

01:07:29

The President of the of the board wrote the JC and saying something to the effect unless you are willing to commit that you would have never done anything like it yourself, right, you have no right to criticise Israel, Israel.

01:07:44

Should be again, but don't don't exercise double standard and what is intervention says yes, yes, yes, we do demand.

01:07:53

Double standards. We should stand up to higher moral standards because we're Jews.

01:07:59

And he writes to explain why you think so.

01:08:03

The real tragedy is, of course, for the Israelis.

01:08:09

And it does not lie in the political deterioration of the borders.

01:08:16

It lies in the moral deterioration of their souls.

01:08:22

What manner of men?

01:08:24

Are these who could contrive this action?

01:08:29

Of what persons could carry it out, or what persons could carry it out? I'm sorry. In what manner of men are those who arrogantly dismissing the moral issue, bemused themselves and us with their real politic?

01:08:45

Where terrorism is used as an instrument of policy, the worst consequences fall on those who use it.

01:08:54

I think it's a powerful Jewish committed Zionist critique of the State of Israel, which was obviously difficult to make from within Israel, but he was able to make it from outside.

01:09:07

It was also possible in Israel, if you know live of.

01:09:11

It yes.

01:09:12

That you mentioned in the book.

01:09:15

Yes, and and and the comparison between life of its reaction to kyia and and war than others is is highly illuminated.

01:09:26

I think we should. Yeah. I think with yeah, we should open up for questions. We'll stop there recording.

01:09:28

Open up for this.

01:09:31

Yes, please.