

# Transcript

00:00:00 Speaker 1

Okay, welcome everyone.

00:00:02 Speaker 1

Happy to see you again.

00:00:04 Speaker 1

Welcome to our weekly seminar in Israel Studies.

00:00:08 Speaker 1

We have the honor to have with us Professor Osarab Abrobiakweder, which is, she's an associate professor at the School of Education at the University of the Negev.

00:00:21 Speaker 1

In her studies, she focuses on the mechanisms of control, racialization, and marginalization of minority groups

00:00:28 Speaker 1

in the fields of higher education, employment, and the family.

00:00:32 Speaker 1

She has published many papers in journals such as Sociology, British Journal of Sociology, and Current Sociology.

00:00:40 Speaker 1

And she's the winner of several competitive grants and prizes, such as the Toronto Prize for Excellence, Young Academic Scholars, Business for Peace, and is chosen as the Sociologist of the Month.

00:00:55 Speaker 1

for current sociology journal in July, 2019.

00:00:59 Speaker 1

In May, 2024, she received an honorary doctorate from Weizmann Institute of Science for promoting epistemic justice for minority groups.

00:01:09 Speaker 1

And along her academic pursuits, Professor Brobey-Equeder is also a feminist activist.

00:01:16 Speaker 1

She serves as a board member in several NGOs and academic committees.

00:01:21 Speaker 1

Her main activity focuses on issues central to Palestinian women, agenda such as access to education, committing polygyny, and improving employment opportunities.

00:01:33 Speaker 1

So I'm excited to listen.

00:01:37 Speaker 1

Welcome.

00:01:37 Speaker 2

Thanks so much.

00:01:38 Speaker 1

The floor is yours.

00:01:39 Speaker 2

Thank you for the invitation, and thank you for attending this seminar.

00:01:43 Speaker 2

So actually, I'm going to speak about not about something that has not been published, but this research has been published.

00:01:52 Speaker 2

both as a book in Hebrew, if you understand Hebrew or you understand, which focuses, the title is Class Identity, Engendering Class Identity Among Palestinian Professional Women in the Negev, focusing on the context of the Palestinian Bedouin of the Negev.

00:02:15 Speaker 2

The main theme that I'm going to present is how inequalities

00:02:21 Speaker 2

reproduced in a field that they should not be reproduced.

00:02:26 Speaker 2

Usually, I will, of course, I will present the literature review, but usually when we speak about professional academic women in every context, either in the West or either in the

Global South, we know that there is a linear line between acquiring higher education and then finding a job.

00:02:48 Speaker 2

But what happens to these women

00:02:51 Speaker 2

professional academic women who succeeded in finding a job, an employment, professional employment, either as doctors or as lawyers or as social workers, the professional middle class.

00:03:04 Speaker 2

However, they face different penalties, and some of them are specific to the Bedouin society that I will present, such as the tribal penalty, and some of them are context-specific

00:03:21 Speaker 2

to the culture, to the state, and to the political history of their location within this structure.

00:03:28 Speaker 2

So the argument here is that I'm going to present the paradox of marginality.

00:03:35 Speaker 2

Yesterday we talked about the term advanced marginality, but today I'm going to talk about the paradox of marginality, which is among middle-class Palestinian professional women, by applying an intersectional analysis in their everyday professional life.

00:03:50 Speaker 2

the lenses that I use here is the intersectional paradigm.

00:03:55 Speaker 2

Why this?

00:03:56 Speaker 2

There is a paradox.

00:03:57 Speaker 2

Despite possessing high educational capital in their society comparable to that of highly educated professional Jewish men and women colleagues and Palestinian male

colleagues, when their professional capital intersects with other power axes within the public sphere,

00:04:12 Speaker 2

such as ethnicity or racism, gender, religious norms, and tribalism, it is not accorded recognition or legitimacy.

00:04:19 Speaker 2

And I will show it through the different penalties.

00:04:23 Speaker 2

But first, let's understand the research gaps.

00:04:26 Speaker 2

Usually, when I look at the Israeli studies that conducted on the topic of Palestinian women at work in Israel, there are two main paradigms that are being

00:04:40 Speaker 2

this topic has been studied.

00:04:43 Speaker 2

First of all, the cultural paradigm, which usually blames the culture, blames tradition, blames the subject, and not taking into consideration the structural institutional factors.

00:04:58 Speaker 2

But then, with another wave of critical scholars, we have also the institutional paradigm, which blames unequal resources.

00:05:09 Speaker 2

of distribution in the labor market, in services, infrastructure, and so on, but ignores or overlooks the colonial structures, the political history that are embedded in this context.

00:05:24 Speaker 2

And this is what's lacking in this knowledge body of body.

00:05:31 Speaker 2

This addressing these frames alone overlooks the multiple intersection mechanisms of control that could be revealed in an intersectional analysis of these women's everyday experience as middle class professionals.

00:05:45 Speaker 2

So who is the population of this study?

00:05:50 Speaker 2

I conducted semi-structured interviews with 50 academic educated Bedouin women.

00:05:55 Speaker 2

This is a qualitative methodology praxis.

00:05:59 Speaker 2

in their mid-20s to mid-30s, employed in the public sector, both in the Bedouin Arab localities, and here I emphasize the Bedouin localities because the Bedouin localities are different, are separated from the Arab localities, but they are Arabs.

00:06:15 Speaker 2

And in the Jewish localities in the southern part of Israel, most of them are married with children, and 20% of them are single.

00:06:26 Speaker 2

The population includes teachers,

00:06:28 Speaker 2

school guidance, counselors, principals, social workers, physicians, nurses, researchers, lawyers, psychologists, pharmacists, and a librarian, only one librarian.

00:06:39 Speaker 2

It's important that to see that I'm focused here on the middle class, which means not the working class, but like the middle upper strata of society, which all of them constitute only 8% of the Bedouin population, which is still very, very low.

00:06:55 Speaker 2

So the research aims here is to reveal, first of all, the concealed violent forms of power practiced by colonialists to what I call declass Palestinian women and preserve the colonialist class superiority in the labor market, and to unpack the logic of elimination through the racialized, everyday lived experience of this middle-class professional woman who succeeded to enter the Jewish workplaces.

00:07:22 Speaker 2

So I rely on three theoretical axes-- the economic logic of elimination in settler colonialism-- settler colonialism is the paradigm, one of the main paradigms that I use-- the politics of declassing in a settler colonial context, and intersectionality.

00:07:39 Speaker 2

When we look at settler colonialism, we combine between two concepts, sovereignty and biopolitics.

00:07:47 Speaker 2

If you're interested, there is a lot of literature on this topic, but I will refer only to the main definitions that I relate to.

00:07:59 Speaker 2

Settler colonialism is defined as a structure.

00:08:03 Speaker 2

Its primary goal is to establish sovereignty and property rights over lands and territory through the logic of eliminating the natives.

00:08:12 Speaker 2

Now, this logic has been practiced for many years on the Palestinian, either in Israel or outside the Green Line, what is called the Green Line, in different fields.

00:08:25 Speaker 2

It could be in citizenship, in lands, space, education, and also in economy.

00:08:33 Speaker 2

Its objective is to achieve through biopolitics, which aimed at administration and regulation of the population.

00:08:40 Speaker 2

as individuals and collectives, including practices of correction, exclusion, normalization, disciplining, selection, and elimination.

00:08:48 Speaker 2

So elimination has various forms, okay, either cultural, and I will present which kind of different mechanisms to eliminate their presence in the hegemonic labor market.

00:09:03 Speaker 2

This will be one of the focuses.

00:09:05 Speaker 2

Sovereignty is driven by body politics that regulate political

00:09:09 Speaker 2

life, organize the community, and maintain local control.

00:09:12 Speaker 2

Body politics refers to the control of the body.

00:09:18 Speaker 2

This is the biopolitics, how you maintain sovereignty through body politics.

00:09:24 Speaker 2

And I will show it later on through the findings.

00:09:28 Speaker 2

I also read a bit about the politics of declassing in a settler colonial context, and I found

00:09:36 Speaker 2

that the middle class, as a category, as a strata in every colonized society, has actually has a very important and meaningful role in the colonial period and in the relations, in the power relations between the settlers and the indigenous.

00:09:58 Speaker 2

Usually, middle class, indigenous middle class, are educated and nationally consciousness.

00:10:04 Speaker 2

OK, they have conscious as middle class that are usually the, you know, the group in society that has been very active.

00:10:12 Speaker 2

in society, they're very active in nationalism, they're very active, which means that they might be or create a threat on the settler colonized regime.

00:10:28 Speaker 2

So in South Africa, for example, the middle class flourished thanks to the missionary education that colonialism provided as part of its acculturation policies.

00:10:39 Speaker 2

However, when this group, educated persons, flourished and demanded, start to demand their rights, they represented a threat to the colonial state.

00:10:52 Speaker 2

And the colonial state responded in developing industrial education to shrink the elite and underdeveloped indigenous society.

00:11:01 Speaker 2

And you can see it in different colonial periods, and this is one example.

00:11:06 Speaker 2

How about Mandatory Palestine?

00:11:08 Speaker 2

The thriving urban intelligentsia played an important role in the Palestinian national movement, and its political and cultural institutions threatened the colonial authorities who responded by adopting various repressive means, as Rosenfeld explained.

00:11:22 Speaker 2

So this concept of declassing, I did not invented it.

00:11:26 Speaker 2

It is based on Rosenfeld's definition from 1978.

00:11:32 Speaker 2

Yeah.

00:11:33 Speaker 2

by declassing Arabs, by officially making them different, superficial and levantine, that state attempts to justify ends, mainly land expropriation, that are specifically directed against Arabs.

00:11:46 Speaker 2

So I take this concept declassing, and it's a kind of a lens through which I'm going to analyze the declassing, the new forms of declassing Palestinian women nowadays.

00:12:00 Speaker 2

Okay, the politics of declassing in Israel from 1948 to 1967, Israeli, there was a military rule in Israel, as you probably know.

00:12:10 Speaker 2

So there was like a military rule means that all the Arabs were constrained, you know, in this area without, especially in the south, in a Siag area, Saij area, which is,

00:12:24 Speaker 2

located between three localities in the Negev.

00:12:29 Speaker 2

They were displaced from their original lands into a space where they could not actually get educated or employed unless they have a special permission from the authorities.

00:12:45 Speaker 2

This military rule has been like a frozen in time and space.

00:12:51 Speaker 2

among the Arab economy, while the Jewish economy and middle class flourished in these decades.

00:13:00 Speaker 2

There is also separation between we can see a separation between the Palestinian there is a geographical separation between Palestinian and Israeli Jewish localities, but also separation in economy, which means that there is also separation but also hierarchy between the economies, while most of the

00:13:18 Speaker 2

economy of the Arab towns is very much poor, underdeveloped, and pretty much also dependent on the Jewish Israeli labor.

00:13:28 Speaker 2

In the recent years, there is a development, especially in high-tech, but still the percentage are very, very low.

00:13:39 Speaker 2

And still most of the industry and the high-tech industry located in the main Jewish cities in Israel.

00:13:49 Speaker 2

Okay, so when referring to the third concept, intersectionality and inequality, the intersectional approach helps to determine how multiple discriminatory systems create a complex configuration of inequalities that structure the relative positions of the Bedouin professional women.

00:14:08 Speaker 2

The proposal of this analysis is to examine how various intersection social divisions are subjectively experienced in their lives

00:14:16 Speaker 2

in their daily professional lives in terms of inclusion and exclusion, discrimination, and disadvantage.

00:14:22 Speaker 2

This approach looks at the complexity of multiple institutions that feed back into each other in a way that reveals micro and macro structures of inequality as non-separated, non-hierarchical social constructs.

00:14:36 Speaker 2

So it's like they're trapped, these women, in these different penalties that I will present.

00:14:44 Speaker 2

And one of the main concepts that I'm going to refer to is representational intersectionality, which means that the way, the cultural construction, the cultural construction, the cultural representation of these women in the daily discourse, like if you look at the cultural archive in every society,

00:15:07 Speaker 2

If we talk about the Muslims, if you refer to women, if you refer to minorities, usually they're all constructed into this cultural paradigm.

00:15:19 Speaker 2

And this representation is part of the mechanisms that create inequality.

00:15:27 Speaker 2

These mechanisms replicate gender and racial hierarchies and thus intensifies women's marginality.

00:15:34 Speaker 2

Let's see how it works.

00:15:35 Speaker 2

Another thing, in intersectional analysis, there are like three ways to analyze.

00:15:42 Speaker 2

One of them, it's called intra-categorical analysis, which means focus on one category, okay, in one category.

00:15:50 Speaker 2

And the aim here is to find like a hidden category, which has not been discussed, you know, in the literature.

00:15:57 Speaker 2

So I found this definition suited to my research because when I started the research,

00:16:04 Speaker 2

My research question that I, when I applied to the, I wrote the proposal to the foundation was why, you know, the reasons for lack of integration of Palestinian professional women in the Israeli labor market.

00:16:19 Speaker 2

So I came with a question, seek to ask about a certain category, professional Palestinian women, but the hidden category that I found

00:16:30 Speaker 2

In the literature of specifically the Palestinian Bedouin in the south was the middle class category, which was a hidden category.

00:16:38 Speaker 2

And as you saw, according to the literature, it is not hidden by mistake.

00:16:44 Speaker 2

There is a history, a political history of this hidden category that this intersectional analysis helped me to reveal it.

00:16:54 Speaker 2

The Naka Bedouin in south end Israel.

00:16:57 Speaker 2

Indigenous Muslim minority, they are 3.5 percent of the Israeli population.

00:17:03 Speaker 2

Half of them lives in unrecognized villages and not included in any statistics.

00:17:09 Speaker 2

Seventy percent of the families are below the poverty line, 90 percent of women are unemployed, 75 percent of women age above the age of 35 are illiterate, 60 percent of the population under the age of 18.

00:17:25 Speaker 2

In 1982, only in 1982, the first Bedouin student entered the university, Ben-Gurion University.

00:17:34 Speaker 2

10 years later, 10 students graduate.

00:17:37 Speaker 2

I was one of those 10.

00:17:40 Speaker 2

Home demolition continues.

00:17:42 Speaker 2

It hasn't stopped, not in the war, not now, not in the COVID, never.

00:17:49 Speaker 2

and only 8% of the holding BA degree, graduate, undergraduate degree, which means that the rate of educated persons in this society is very, very low, even comparable to the rest of the Arab society in Israel.

00:18:11 Speaker 2

And I will, if you, I can talk also about the unrecognized villages maybe in the discussion.

00:18:16 Speaker 2

So what I found, I found four intersectional penalties, and the term penalties is also based taken from the literature, mostly from the Western literature on minority women in the labor force.

00:18:27 Speaker 2

So the literature refers to three main penalties, okay?

00:18:31 Speaker 2

It's the racial penalty, religious penalty, and gender penalty.

00:18:37 Speaker 2

It is context-based.

00:18:39 Speaker 2

The definitions are not far from what I found.

00:18:41 Speaker 2

However, they have their own specifics according to the context that I found.

00:18:46 Speaker 2

And the new penalty that has been added to this literature from this field work is the tribal penalty.

00:18:52 Speaker 2

Tribal penalty has not been discussed in the literature on minority women.

00:18:57 Speaker 2

And I think this is the contribution of the study.

00:19:00 Speaker 2

And from my perception, this is the most dangerous penalty

00:19:05 Speaker 2

that these women experience, and you will see why.

00:19:09 Speaker 2

So what is a racial penalty?

00:19:12 Speaker 2

A racial penalty is a creation of hierarchies and binary contrast based on an imposition of a sole hegemonic, legitimate, cultural meaning while concealing the power relations in which such legitimacy is grounded.

00:19:25 Speaker 2

What does it mean?

00:19:26 Speaker 2

Let's see.

00:19:28 Speaker 2

The racial penalty in this context

00:19:31 Speaker 2

could be summarized, can be summarized in, you know, in one sentence that repeats itself throughout the findings.

00:19:40 Speaker 2

Most of the women can repeat the sentence that you have to prove your professionalism despite being an Arab.

00:19:47 Speaker 2

Okay, you asked me if they define themselves.

00:19:50 Speaker 2

So this is what I received from that.

00:19:53 Speaker 2

And what does it mean?

00:19:53 Speaker 2

So I published two papers on this topic, and I will present only part of the findings because of the lack of time.

00:20:02 Speaker 2

This racial penalty demonstrates itself through two layers.

00:20:07 Speaker 2

One is through the employer's racism, and the second through colleagues' and clients' racist actions.

00:20:14 Speaker 2

When employers' racism is manifested through cultural gaps,

00:20:19 Speaker 2

baby-- the construction of the representation of Bedouin women as baby breeder, regulation of traditional representation as an excuse, as a legitimate excuse of not hiring or not promoting her.

00:20:37 Speaker 2

The use of symbolic violence, the use of her dependency in the patriarchy or in the workplace in order to

00:20:47 Speaker 2

make her or make them not speak or not demand the rights.

00:20:54 Speaker 2

There is also an ethnic and patriarchal trap, which, again, using their dependence in patriarchy in order to prevent them to, again, to demand the rights.

00:21:07 Speaker 2

And the other aspect is colleagues and clients' racist reaction.

00:21:14 Speaker 2

There is this concept that I found.

00:21:15 Speaker 2

I called it from the field muted racism.

00:21:19 Speaker 2

They speak about racist looks of non-appreciation, fear of legitimating Bedouin women's professionalism, sorry, and fear of speaking Arabic.

00:21:33 Speaker 2

So sorry for the error here.

00:21:36 Speaker 2

Yeah, so let's take a few of the examples from the field.

00:21:42 Speaker 2

Bedouin women, so here I'm referring to this phrase out of place, settler denial of indigenous professionalism, which is the topic here.

00:21:53 Speaker 2

Bedouin women sense that they have to bear the burden of proof that they are professional.

00:21:58 Speaker 2

Ignoring status, class, or a professional capital is defined as a racist practice as it reflects an a priori assumption

00:22:07 Speaker 2

that our professional women are out of place, which means they're out of the category where they're supposed to be according to the colonial imagination.

00:22:16 Speaker 2

This assumption is based on the colonial archive of public discourse in Israel, relying on racism, like habits transmitted and imprinted in institutions, everyday life organizations, thinking patterns, behavior, and attitudes toward the other.

00:22:30 Speaker 2

which unfortunately we are experiencing even more than the last two years.

00:22:37 Speaker 2

The cultural gap, excuse, based on habitus and cultural trends, the hegemonic group uses its legitimate culture to designate cultural distance and proximity while recruiting or excluding new occupants, thereby effectively defining the boundaries of the professional group.

00:22:56 Speaker 2

The librarian, one librarian,

00:22:59 Speaker 2

She did a lot of work till she managed to reach this very prestigious position, according to her.

00:23:07 Speaker 2

So again, I have to say that this is a qualitative research, and I'm presenting I will present also some quotes to illustrate some examples.

00:23:18 Speaker 2

She says, I very much want to be responsible for a department.

00:23:22 Speaker 2

I completed a graduate degree and I have experience, but someone, a Jewish employee who just begun studying the profession was put right into the job.

00:23:30 Speaker 2

I asked, why are you giving her the job when I have been here for years?

00:23:35 Speaker 2

I see that time keeps dragging and I have no idea whether they want me.

00:23:39 Speaker 2

One official said I should not be there because of the cultural gap.

00:23:44 Speaker 2

I know they are sabotaging me because of cultural gaps.

00:23:52 Speaker 2

The BO power in the service of Jewish sovereignty cultural marker.

00:23:56 Speaker 2

Okay, colonial domination and guaranteed sovereignty in public institutions is expressed primarily by blocking the progress of Palestinian professional women and placing only Jewish women in managerial positions in some professions.

00:24:10 Speaker 2

One family health center nurse reported.

00:24:13 Speaker 2

When you see someone that they brought in from Russia who barely speaks Hebrew, people don't-- people, the Bedouin people, the Bedouin woman client, don't understand her.

00:24:22 Speaker 2

It's a cold catastrophe.

00:24:23 Speaker 2

I asked, why all the instructors are Jewish?

00:24:27 Speaker 2

Why do they hire so many Jewish employers and then have to rely on translation?

00:24:32 Speaker 2

BioPower process aims at replacing the surplus Palestinian body impeding the colonizers' expansion.

00:24:40 Speaker 2

Symbolic violence.

00:24:41 Speaker 2

When professional women criticize the prejudice of Jewish coworkers towards Palestinian Bedouin clients, they are subjected to symbolic violence that exploits their dependence on their employer and their desire to advance.

00:24:54 Speaker 2

This symbolic violence created difficulties in social mobility.

00:24:58 Speaker 2

A physician reports the reaction to her criticism of her colleagues' demanding attitudes towards Arab Bedouin patients.

00:25:08 Speaker 2

They began to say, I am a troublemaker and I am a rebellion.

00:25:11 Speaker 2

Rebellious, my boss told me, if you have a reputation as a troublemaker, you won't be staying.

00:25:19 Speaker 2

I know a lot of women, you know, regardless of which culture you are, probably heard this, or minority men maybe, heard this statement.

00:25:29 Speaker 2

However, this is exactly using the marginalized position of this woman, and especially we're talking here about the first physician.

00:25:37 Speaker 2

This is the first Bedouin physician in Bedouin society who is

00:25:41 Speaker 2

at the same time struggling for her position as a pioneer, and she becomes a role model for her society.

00:25:49 Speaker 2

At the same time, she has to keep her mouth shut and not criticizing the institution.

00:25:55 Speaker 2

It's a very trapped position and difficult position to be at.

00:26:00 Speaker 2

Hostile otherness in language and space, the politics of fear, and language and speaking in Arabic.

00:26:07 Speaker 2

in a Hebrew spoken space, the dominant space, is another issue which intensifies, especially during wars.

00:26:19 Speaker 2

Colonialists exclude indigenous people from hegemonic space by framing their language as threatening, using the economy of fear as a mechanism to secure the colonizers' authority over space-time, and life.

00:26:30 Speaker 2

Their national identity, this woman's national identity as Arabs or Palestinians

00:26:36 Speaker 2

turned these women into hostile, feared others who lost their sense of belonging to their workplace.

00:26:42 Speaker 2

They report apprehension about expressing political views, speaking about Arab national identity, and fear of racist responses.

00:26:50 Speaker 2

One Health Systems employee said, I am at this place, but I don't exactly belong.

00:26:56 Speaker 2

I have a gut feeling that keeps me from being confident that this is my place.

00:27:00 Speaker 2

I cannot say everything I want to say without fear.

00:27:03 Speaker 2

It's very distressing.

00:27:06 Speaker 2

Arabic language as a marker for dangerous other.

00:27:09 Speaker 2

This fear is intensified by employers who insist on using the hegemonic language even when treating Arab-speaking patients, insisting that the Arab professional use Hebrew language.

00:27:22 Speaker 2

One participant attest, The director told me, you know what?

00:27:26 Speaker 2

You're right.

00:27:27 Speaker 2

There are Arabs, but that doesn't mean you have to speak to them in Arabic, speak Hebrew.

00:27:33 Speaker 2

Internalization of such apprehension by Palestinian women professionals attest to reproduction of Jewish sovereignty of public space on the normative status of Hebrew as the superior language, and we know in recent year also the national law and the inferioring, putting down the second the Arabic language.

00:27:59 Speaker 2

The Arabic language is no longer the second formal language in Israel, which also affect the okay.

00:28:07 Speaker 2

I'm moving now to the second penalty, which is the religious penalty, which also is part of the politics of fear.

00:28:16 Speaker 2

The religious penalty, according to the literature, literature revolves around religious attire, especially head-covering as part of the colonial politics of fear of Islam as a terror, and

00:28:27 Speaker 2

Muslim and fear of Muslim women.

00:28:31 Speaker 2

Racist rejection of Muslim women for jobs.

00:28:33 Speaker 2

I wanted to, one woman who seek to work in a, I think she's a lawyer and she came with the hijab to the Jewish office and she says, I wanted to clerk, I wanted to clerk there, sorry.

00:28:51 Speaker 2

But the manager looked at me and I was in full religious attire.

00:28:56 Speaker 2

Right at the beginning, when I came in, she said, oh, you're religious.

00:28:59 Speaker 2

The minute she said that, I knew.

00:29:01 Speaker 2

She didn't want someone religious working there, so I wasn't accepted.

00:29:05 Speaker 2

Then I realized they are not interested in someone with a head covering.

00:29:08 Speaker 2

I have to say that I don't know how it works here in Oxford or in the UK, but in certain universities in Israel, women with full niqab are being judged.

00:29:22 Speaker 2

and excluded from the universities, not a lot of them.

00:29:27 Speaker 2

There were a few cases, one in a college and another two students in another university, one of the main universities, which were like, I mean, I don't really understand that.

00:29:41 Speaker 2

They were given a condition, either you take off the niqab, the niqab, not the hijab.

00:29:46 Speaker 2

The niqab, if you want, or you will not return to study.

00:29:52 Speaker 2

So there is a legal, a lot now, a legal discussion among the feminists, okay?

00:29:56 Speaker 2

And I'm asking, this is another question, what is feminism here?

00:30:00 Speaker 2

This is a different discussion.

00:30:04 Speaker 2

Okay, there is also a different, another aspect.

00:30:08 Speaker 2

of their religious legitimacy in Bedouin workplaces.

00:30:11 Speaker 2

And this is why I stressed the Bedouin localities.

00:30:15 Speaker 2

Bedouin localities where women work maybe mostly as either nurses, especially teachers, principals, the public sector in the Bedouin towns, there is more legitimacy for covered women with a hijab than for women than for non-covered women.

00:30:35 Speaker 2

And this is also a problem.

00:30:38 Speaker 2

for the minority non-covered woman that one of them said the problem is that head cover becomes the norm.

00:30:44 Speaker 2

Okay, so this is another patriarchal aspect of the religious penalty that I found in this specific context.

00:30:52 Speaker 2

The gender penalty, the gender penalty in this context refer to taking the private, the gender norms from the private sector to the public sector.

00:31:05 Speaker 2

from public sphere, from the private sphere to the public sphere, and blurring the boundaries between these two spheres.

00:31:16 Speaker 2

And so what is gender penalty?

00:31:20 Speaker 2

How are women perceived in both the colonial, national, and the national or ethno discourse?

00:31:28 Speaker 2

In both colonial and kinship modes of collective thinking, women are perceived as markers of the boundaries of the national or family collective, differentiating us from them.

00:31:39 Speaker 2

They are considered key figures in ethno-colonial and collective reproduction because of the discipline to which they are subjected, based on the symbolic representation of their bodies and sexualities.

00:31:52 Speaker 2

So how is gender penalty manifested in this case?

00:31:58 Speaker 2

Remember the racist penalty, right?

00:31:59 Speaker 2

So the gender penalty, the repeated sentence among the participant was that you have to prove you are a good woman, both inside and outside of home.

00:32:12 Speaker 2

And here we see the patriarchal norms in action, both in the public sphere and in the private sphere.

00:32:18 Speaker 2

However, they in the private sphere, they could overcome this, some of them, these norms.

00:32:25 Speaker 2

In the public sphere,

00:32:28 Speaker 2

There is a non-promotion, first of all, by men managers.

00:32:34 Speaker 2

Blurring or not making the boundaries between being a woman or being a professional were blurred in the public sphere.

00:32:48 Speaker 2

And I will present some examples.

00:32:50 Speaker 2

And of course, sexual harassment in some cases.

00:32:53 Speaker 2

The patriarchy in the private sphere demonstrates itself in several cases by unsupportive spouses, but not only the nuclear family, also the criticism from the extended family.

00:33:05 Speaker 2

And here, we refer to the very specific context, the collective structure of the society, that the extended nuclear family lives usually amidst the extended family, usually in one neighborhood, which is a kin-based

00:33:23 Speaker 2

neighborhood, either in towns or in unrecognized villages, that especially women who apply, who work in professions such as nurses or lawyers or social workers, that they need to travel away from home or to have an overnight in the hospital or things like that.

00:33:46 Speaker 2

Even if the husband support and approves, the extended family has put a lot of pressure.

00:33:53 Speaker 2

And so I asked, so how you continue to do that to your job?

00:34:00 Speaker 2

So most of them have supportive spouses that has to actually fight back the family, okay, and become this shield for her in order to be able to go to this unusual world.

00:34:20 Speaker 2

There is also an issue of the Jewish holidays and the Muslim holidays.

00:34:25 Speaker 2

So if a nurse or a physician works in a hospital, she has to choose.

00:34:30 Speaker 2

Either you choose the Jewish holidays or the Muslim holidays.

00:34:34 Speaker 2

Most of them choose.

00:34:35 Speaker 2

What do you think?

00:34:38 Speaker 2

The Jewish holidays, because they're much more.

00:34:43 Speaker 2

They're much more.

00:34:45 Speaker 2

And this is also a source of conflict within the extended family.

00:34:51 Speaker 2

OK.

00:34:52 Speaker 2

So a few examples-- a woman or a professional.

00:34:56 Speaker 2

Entering a male-dominated domain.

00:34:58 Speaker 2

Some of the professions in this specific context and time that maybe in other contexts has become-- this profession have become a feminine professions, in Bedouin society, they're still male-dominated, such as

00:35:15 Speaker 2

school principals such as lawyers.

00:35:18 Speaker 2

Okay, yes, this is the most.

00:35:21 Speaker 2

So a woman attorney, this is very interesting just to hear the quote.

00:35:27 Speaker 2

When I left for court, you see that all the attorneys, the Bedouin male attorneys around you are male Arab Bedouin who assess you as a woman and not as an attorney.

00:35:36 Speaker 2

I felt as though I were entering the Shig, a place where men gather to make family decision from the private sphere, as though it were.

00:35:45 Speaker 2

Everyone immediately looks at you and labels you.

00:35:48 Speaker 2

They were amused by a young woman who is both an Arab Bedouin and an attorney.

00:35:52 Speaker 2

I felt they were belittling me as a professional woman.

00:35:59 Speaker 2

OK, this is-- and now we finally arrive to the tribal penalty.

00:36:06 Speaker 2

And tribalism is a-- tribalism, this is the structure of Bedouin societies based on tribalism.

00:36:12 Speaker 2

Tribalism has roots also in the colonial order that in the case of Israel and the Bedouin case, the state also intensified and empowered the tribal structure.

00:36:25 Speaker 2

For instance, when in the late '60s, when the military rule was demolished or ended,

00:36:36 Speaker 2

Most of the neighborhoods in these new modernized towns were structured according to tribal affiliation, which means that schools are based on tribal affiliations.

00:36:49 Speaker 2

In high schools, you know, so you have this neighborhood from one kin, one tribe, and it's like a mini state, okay, that has its own authority, its own sovereignty.

00:37:01 Speaker 2

Okay, and then it becomes very, very difficult

00:37:04 Speaker 2

for, and it's also male dominated and tribal dominated.

00:37:08 Speaker 2

And then if you want to fight for your rights, okay, as a marginalized woman or people at risk, I will give an example, and you apply, you know, to the Jewish hegemonic superior, okay, the superior does not interfere, does not interfere.

00:37:27 Speaker 2

Okay, so, and so how this tribal penalty is experienced by these women.

00:37:33 Speaker 2

It is experienced mainly through the conflict between the tribal codes, okay, tribal way of life, the tribal codes, such as prohibition of involvement in the affairs of other tribes, and the professional codes such as those demanding legal intervention in the affairs of

other tribes or dissemination of information outside the tribe for professional purposes, okay?

00:37:58 Speaker 2

So we see it in the case of, especially,

00:38:02 Speaker 2

when we talk about here population at risk such as women or children in families at risk in like experiencing violence and the social worker has to interfere and get the kid out of the house and go to the police, this is an issue.

00:38:24 Speaker 2

And so here the situation in the genders not only are a Bedouin.

00:38:29 Speaker 2

So what happens here is that

00:38:32 Speaker 2

the Bedouin tribe or the Bedouin members of this tribe, of the victim's tribe, go, they like complain, make a complaint against this professional woman to her father, not her husband, to her father, and it become an issue, a big issue, okay?

00:38:55 Speaker 2

It become a tribal conflict.

00:38:58 Speaker 2

And then they have to solve it according to the tribal rules and not according to the professional rules, which eventually hurt the population at risk.

00:39:11 Speaker 2

Violent, abused women and children.

00:39:14 Speaker 2

There is also a tribal and another level of this tribal penalty, which is the tribal institutional contract.

00:39:21 Speaker 2

where, like I said, if you apply to their superior, usually a Jewish superior, either a social worker or the police, or the Ministry of Education, they don't interfere.

00:39:35 Speaker 2

Now, it's like polygamy, they don't interfere.

00:39:38 Speaker 2

It's like other violent aspects that happen in the Arab society that they don't interfere.

00:39:47 Speaker 2

And we have a story of an attorney at one of the legal center of Bedouin Women's Rights relates that women come to her with cases of violence against them that the town police refused to investigate.

00:39:59 Speaker 2

Rather than bringing charges against the perpetrator, the police send the victim back to the juridic...

00:40:09 Speaker 2

English, think of the sheikh, the traditional leader or other tribal representative to resolve the problem within accepted tribal rules in order to avoid conflict between tribes.

00:40:20 Speaker 2

She recalls, even when I approach Jewish officials at the social service ministry, they simply turned a blind eye

00:40:28 Speaker 2

and were unwilling to talk to me.

00:40:30 Speaker 2

These contracts are a kind of barter with which to appease Bedouin society and avoid violent conflict among tribes, even if women's interests are sacrificed.

00:40:40 Speaker 2

They perceived us as the professional woman, a risk to society, and thereby refuse to cooperate with us.

00:40:47 Speaker 2

Are we okay here?

00:40:50 Speaker 2

It's a false around?

00:40:51 Speaker 2

Someone's really alerted.

00:40:53 Speaker 2

No, I'm not.

00:40:54 Speaker 2

Good, it's okay.

00:40:57 Speaker 2

You can understand why.

00:40:59 Speaker 2

So here, this tribal contract, tribal institutional contract, create what Crenshaw calls intersectional subordination.

00:41:11 Speaker 2

It is...

00:41:13 Speaker 2

it is a frequent the consequence it is a consequence of the imposition of one burden that interacts with preexisting vulnerabilities to create yet another dimension of this empowerment.

00:41:23 Speaker 2

And this is exactly what happened in this the case of this it calls like it calls she calls it Chaining.

00:41:32 Speaker 2

Chaining.

00:41:33 Speaker 2

Three.

00:41:33 Speaker 2

Yeah.

00:41:34 Speaker 2

This is exactly what happens here.

00:41:35 Speaker 2

Not only professional women are hurt their professionalism, but also the population at risk.

00:41:41 Speaker 2

And for me, this is, from my perspective, the most dangerous penalty they experience.

00:41:47 Speaker 2

So how is intersectionality manifested in this -- There is someone trying to turn it off.

00:41:53 Speaker 2

It's just -- Okay.

00:41:55 Speaker 2

I thought there is someone who's trying to -- Thank you.

00:41:57 Speaker 2

No, it's a false alarm.

00:41:59 Speaker 2

Okay.

00:42:00 Speaker 2

We don't use the false alarm, unfortunately.

00:42:02 Speaker 2

You were getting too edgy, though.

00:42:04 Speaker 2

Okay.

00:42:05 Speaker 2

So

00:42:07 Speaker 2

the intersecting, we can see the intersection of these power structures, the tribal, the religious, the gender, and the ethnic, is inherent in their common practice of clustering to block recognition of the professional capital.

00:42:24 Speaker 2

And it creates the paradox of professional marginality.

00:42:28 Speaker 2

Academic-educated Palestinian women with professional jobs

00:42:31 Speaker 2

like I said, are part of the most educated group in their society and have succeeded in crossing boundaries and gaining access to economic and human capital resources trapped in metrics of domination.

00:42:42 Speaker 2

Following Bourdie's class body hierarchy, in which bodies of women and non-white persons are dehumanized and uncontrolled and like controlled and cultured white bourgeois bodies, I claim that the controlled and civilized bodies of Palestinian women who enter the hegemonic workplace

00:43:00 Speaker 2

are threatening the hierarchies of these later class bodies.

00:43:03 Speaker 2

The presence of class bourgeois bodies of Palestinian professional women is not wanted in shared public space because it threatens the growth and sovereignty of the bourgeois body that rules the hegemonic place.

00:43:14 Speaker 2

And we can see it, by the way, in different institutions, in different aspects.

00:43:20 Speaker 2

I can elaborate also on that.

00:43:22 Speaker 2

So why the indigenous bodies, a woman's body, is so important in the settler colonial mind?

00:43:28 Speaker 2

Because to the settler, the figure of a native female function as a metonym for unending increase and production of land bodies that impede settler expansion and is consequently perceived as a surplus body that should be eliminated.

00:43:42 Speaker 2

This work-- so inequality here is measured.

00:43:46 Speaker 2

before that.

00:43:47 Speaker 2

The main point here, the main argument, as we can see, that inequality cannot be measured only in economic terms or statistical terms, but also in recognition terms.

00:44:01 Speaker 2

The recognition here is very, very important because it reproduces lack of recognition, and we see its manifestation in the different examples.

00:44:12 Speaker 2

And finally, this work has been published in the Paradox of Professional Marginality Among Arab Edwin Women in Sociology Journal and the Biopolitics of the Classic Palestinian Professional Woman in the Current Sociology in 2019.

00:44:28 Speaker 2

You're right.

00:44:28 Speaker 2

And it also was chosen as-- I was chosen as the Sociologist of the Month due to that work and, of course, the book.

00:44:39 Speaker 2

Thank you.

00:44:45 Speaker 1

Thank you very much.

00:44:46 Speaker 1

We didn't mention that Professor Borbekuda is really on time, so we finished 45 minutes on the clock and we could stop the recording.