

# Transcript

00:00:00 Speaker 2

Hello and welcome to the Migration Oxford podcast. I'm Jackie Broadhead.

00:00:03 Speaker 1

And I'm Rob MacNeil.

00:00:05 Speaker 2

Rob, what are we talking about today?

00:00:07

Ohh.

00:00:08 Speaker 1

What are we not talking about today? It's been a very interesting conversation about transatlantic relationships and geopolitics in a world of increasingly right wing politics.

00:00:21 Speaker 1

6 and what that means from an immigration point of view, mainly focusing on Germany and the US, but with the kind of wider look at things as well.

00:00:31 Speaker 2

And we should say for listeners, we're recording it a bit of an interesting moment directly after the inauguration of Donald Trump, but a little bit before the German election. So we're having a conversation at a particular moment in time, and you might be listening to it a little bit later and have a sense of what's happened. And this conversation is a little bit sort of preview.

00:00:51 Speaker 2

What might happen into those elections and Rob, I guess I'm just interested at this kind of moment in time your perspective on why looking at Germany and the US is a kind of interesting way into some of these actually kind of quite broad trends, right?

00:01:11 Speaker 1

Well, I think that I mean there there, I mean there are two fundamental reasons which is I mean like Germany and the US are economic superpowers and that have an enormous international international kind of.

00:01:23 Speaker 1

Clout, as it were.

00:01:25 Speaker 1

But there are also massive immigration countries and countries that are shifting towards a more and more.

00:01:33 Speaker 1

Well, a less and less open perspective on migration issues in sort of various slightly different ways. I mean, the US focus is moving is is primarily looking is.

00:01:44 Speaker 1

Those at the issue of irregular migration, but not completely, and there's this move away from, for example, birth right, citizenship and all that kind of stuff. But Germany is important because of, particularly because there has been this, you know, very substantial demographic shift in terms you know particularly with with.

00:02:04 Speaker 1

A large number of people claiming asylum and yeah, and a large number of refugees in the country over the last decade or so.

00:02:12 Speaker 1

But what we discussed in some detail was the question of what the future holds for both of these countries, and particularly, I mean there was a there was a fair amount of focus on demography, but also on the pragmatic choices that people will have to make.

00:02:32 Speaker 1

In these in ageing societies, in order to both assuage concerns that are coming from the right, whilst also not destroying their their economies, and that was an interesting an interesting little kind of Nexus to get to.

00:02:45 Speaker 2

Some of the kind of longer term trends alongside some very kind of immediate pressures. One of the things that's interesting to me is that I feel that we talk a lot about narrative and and the kind of journalistic side, I guess maybe a little bit from your perspective. And then I'm very involved in a lot of the kind of policy.

00:03:05 Speaker 2

And those decisions, I'm not sure we as often talk totally explicitly about the politics.

00:03:11 Speaker 2

And the link between the kind of realities of migration, the narratives around migration and then just the bare politics of it, and it felt like in this discussion, we were getting closer perhaps to why it is that migration sits so high up those lists of political priorities and also the impacts that it's having.

00:03:31 Speaker 2

On the politics of these two.

00:03:33 Speaker 2

It's.

00:03:34 Speaker 1

Yeah, I think that's absolutely right. And I think that what we were also addressing was how these politics are activated, what is the process by which we get to a point where the issue of migration becomes a big deal in national politics, which has clearly happened in the US and has clearly happened in Germany.

00:03:55 Speaker 1

And part of that part of what we were looking at was the question of is this to do with numbers, is it to do with people arriving in a country now obviously both Germany and the US have very, very high levels of immigration or have done for the last have done for the last decade or so and and longer in in the US.

00:04:13 Speaker 1

But also the extent to which political parties, while trying to, I suppose, shoot the right wing fox, as it were, in terms of like the rise of of anti immigration narratives, often end up doing the wrong well, making the wrong choice by attempting to take on those right wing parties by shifting.

00:04:34 Speaker 1

To the right themselves, and that that then ends up creating a scenario where instead of taking hold of the narrative they they are simply carried along with.

00:04:44 Speaker 1

And it and it becomes embedded in the national politics. It becomes normal or, you know, highly anti immigration narratives become progressively more and more normalised, and then essentially the ratchet mechanism moves around a a cog and cannot then be be moved back. Or it's much, much harder then to move it back.

00:05:05 Speaker 1

And I think that that's a really interesting sort of space to get into because it is fundamentally about how publics.

00:05:12 Speaker 1

Move and how politicians move and how basically the strategies of right wing organisations in terms of creating a space in which migration becomes a highly salient issue, that they can capitalise on can be very effective.

00:05:29 Speaker 2

That feels pretty much like the perfect moment to hand over to our experts.

00:05:35 Speaker 1

I'm joined today by Professor Doctor Naika Foroutan, who's a social scientist and professor for integration studies at Humboldt University, and the director of the German Institute for Migration and Integration Research or Design.

00:05:47 Speaker 1

And by Professor Tariq Abu Shadi, who is professor of European politics at the Department of Politics and International Relations at the University of Oxford and a professorial fellow at Nuffield College. Both of you welcome to the podcast. And can I start by asking you?

00:06:02 Speaker 1

Both.

00:06:03 Speaker 1

Where do you currently see the relationship between Europe and the US heading over the next four years?

00:06:09 Speaker 1

And what role do you think the politics of migration in Germany and in the USA are likely to play in that?

00:06:16 Speaker 1

Should we start with you, Nika?

00:06:18 Speaker 3

Thank you. Well, actually this is a big question and I think the role of the US is going to be determined with every other country in the world within the upcoming weeks. So if I just focus on Germany, I suppose it won't be as different as focusing on any other European country who is now.

00:06:38 Speaker 3

Struggling and asking themselves how their position towards the US might get managed within the.

00:06:45 Speaker 3

Next years to come. So I mean, there's obviously several questions from, I don't know, let's say geopolitical tensions, economic policies. Will the US keep up backing the NATO or will we face at the end of the NATO, maybe within the next year is how is the US going to?

00:07:06 Speaker 3

Be positioned towards Russia and Ukraine. Obviously there's also economic policies. Are there going to be like different kind of taxes on European?

00:07:19 Speaker 3

Good and well, obviously security corporations, not only when it comes to Russia, but also when it comes to Israel, all these will be things to just mingle out within the next years. But obviously I think today we're going to talk about one key factor that is going to be.

00:07:39 Speaker 3

Migration and how this will differ between the US and Germany?

00:07:45 Speaker 1

And do you have any views about what the kind of shifting geopolitics of of the world I suppose right now mean for migration and what and and specifically for Germany or not?

00:07:55 Speaker 3

Well, actually I would say that if we have a look at migration, there's similarities and there's differences when it comes to handling this issue. Well, Germany is also confronted with elections that are going to be in February 23rd.

00:08:16 Speaker 3

And we also can see the rise of the far right party Afd here in Germany and they are also pressuring a lot the migration issue. But on the other side, Germany is also confronted with a different demographic factor comparing to to the US it's a very old society.

00:08:36 Speaker 3

And we are facing a lot of shortages in in key sectors of the labour market and these shortages can't be managed by fertility policies. So they have to be managed through migration and we can face this big mismatch in the policies to come.

00:08:57 Speaker 3

Germany is in dire need of migration on the one side.

00:09:01 Speaker 3

And under very high pressure by right wing political parties who don't want kind of any migration at all or they dream of a kind of utilitarian migration, mainly picking white immigrants from wherever in the world that would be.

00:09:21 Speaker 3

So we can talk about that imagination of white immigration to Germany, which obviously will not be what the country is going to face in the next.

00:09:29 Speaker 3

Kate.

00:09:30 Speaker 1

So Terry, if I can, if I can just turn to you. And with that same question about, I mean, where do we think the relationship between the Europe and the US is heading and what that what the implications of that are for migration issues in both countries I suppose?

00:09:43 Speaker 4

Yeah. So I think to understand the relationship between the US and and Europe and specific European countries, we really have to think through a lens of the politics of the far right, the new US President is a far right policy.

00:09:59 Speaker 4

Many European countries have now strong far right parties have far right Heads of Government, and so on. And so this will be a dominant question of how these countries conduct themselves internationally and nationally. Here, of course, immigration can also be understood through an indirect immigration.

00:10:18 Speaker 4

As a political issue that is so central for.

00:10:23 Speaker 4

For right, and I think it's important to emphasise that it's really indirect. So the politics of the far right don't necessarily correlate with the levels of immigration. The far right isn't

stronger where we have more immigration. Immigration is a political issue that political actors use, and because of the use of this issue.

00:10:43 Speaker 4

These actors have become more strong, they've received more political support. They've also become more legitimate political actors. So immigration as a political issue really is essential for the success of these actors. But immigration as a political issue is only weakly correlated with actual levels of immigration for.

00:11:02 Speaker 4

Simple.

00:11:03 Speaker 1

Thank you so much. That's really, really helpful. Now Nika, we touched on this already, the the rise of a FD in Germany and I mean FD has had, you know, some fairly remarkable success in, in, in local elections which obviously we are. I mean we're we're watching with with great interest to see what happens in the national elections.

00:11:23 Speaker 1

But that electoral success has kind of shaken some of the preconceptions. The older preconceptions that we have about modern Germany as one of these kind of beacons of European social liberalism.

00:11:35 Speaker 1

And it also seems to have generally shifted German immigration policy. So, I mean, what do you think that this means for Germany? And do you have any views about?

00:11:44 Speaker 1

Where this is taking the country.

00:11:46 Speaker 3

Yeah, and well, actually I have to add on what Tarek has been describing has been describing because in Germany, in fact, we can see that the number of immigration and immigrants has been rising dramatically within the past decade, so in fact.

00:12:07 Speaker 3

Within the past 10 years.

00:12:09 Speaker 3

Germany has turned into one of the key major actors in migration politics in the world, so it ranks second right after the US when it comes to international migrants, and it also ranks within the top five refugee accepting countries since nearly 10 years.

00:12:30 Speaker 3

And we don't have the UK within that top five and we don't have the US and we don't have.

00:12:35 Speaker 3

Canada, Well, the other countries who rank within these top five are Iran, Turkey, Colombia and Uganda. So there is no European country, no US, and no classical immigration country within this list. So in fact, Germany has changed its face and it has changed its rank.

00:12:56 Speaker 3

In the, let's say, leading migration players in the world, so we cannot say that there is no correlation between the number.

00:13:05 Speaker 3

And the right wing parties, even though I agree with Tariq, if we compare it to other countries, we will not face that correlation so highly, but it makes it difficult for politicians to argue that the ID is just recurring to a fictional subject because the subject is very true. It has changed.

00:13:25 Speaker 3

Also, the visible identity within the country itself.

00:13:29 Speaker 3

More than 30% of this country already have a so-called migration background, zooming into children under 18, it's already 43%, so we might face minority majority change within the this upcoming decade even. And so people are kind of renegotiating.

00:13:50 Speaker 3

National identity what it means to be German, how Germany is evolving as a post migrant migrant society. All these factors are not only like imaginary.

00:14:04 Speaker 3

But still what we can see is that the IFD is managing to have that illusion that we could do without immigrants here. And I mean they are right now ranking second in the upcoming election polls you were asking about the Social Democrats.

00:14:24 Speaker 3



The liberal identity of this country, if we look up the latest polls, the Social Democrats are only.

00:14:31 Speaker 3

Pouring, I think 16%, I mean 16% compared to the double. The Christian Democrats are scoring and the IFD is in in a quite stable 20%. Therefore, yes, you're right, there is a big pressure. The Liberals, the FDP, they, they might even not get into the.

00:14:52 Speaker 3

Parliament and also the green parties that have been like the beacon of hope in the last elections. They are only scoring 13%. So there is a big right wing shift and we are going to face that on 23rd of Feb.

00:15:08 Speaker 1

That's fascinating. I mean, another component of the situation that we are in now with this shifting situation for 2025 is the return of Donald Trump. Obviously to American politics and the implications that that's got not only for the the, the basic policy making in the US but also.

00:15:27 Speaker 1

For the realities of international agreements as well. So Tariq, can I ask you, what do you see as the implications of Trump's return for immigration policy in the US, but also for international agreements? And what do you think it means for all of those of us on the other side of the Atlantic, whether in Germany, the UK or else?

00:15:44

Right.

00:15:45 Speaker 4

So Donald Trump is an authoritarian nationalist whose advisers rank somewhere from far right to fascist and fascist is not a word. I use a lot to describe contemporary politics, but for some of some of Trump's advisers, this is the the correct ideology to describe them. So of course, their goal is to.

00:16:04 Speaker 4

To undermine the legitimacy of international institutions to withdraw the US where they can, on his first day in office, Donald Trump already withdrew from the Paris climate Agreement and the World Health Organisation. So it is very, very clear that all policy issues that depend on international collaboration and institutions.

00:16:26 Speaker 4

Will be massively threatened by the current U.S. government. Now if we look at the other side, of course we could say what other countries should do is step up their internationalism, work on stronger integration, trying to counterbalance.

00:16:40 Speaker 4

Instance. But what we've seen in other countries are now taking Germany as an example, is of course the opposite. In the previous years on many issues, Germany, the last German government, really has undermined the role of the European Union. If we think of immigration policy by closing the borders, undermining the free movement of people.

00:17:00 Speaker 4

As one ideal of the European Union and the issue of Israel and Gaza, Germany has fundamentally undermined the the legitimacy of the international courts. So other actors really haven't stepped up their internationalism, which would be a an essential factor in countering.

00:17:19 Speaker 4

Thing these movements from the US and unfortunately we're not seeing this.

00:17:23 Speaker 1

No, OK. If I can return to you, I mean, as Terry has already alluded, we're already hearing a lot of rhetoric about from Germany rather about the potential for stricter border controls and expedited migrant removal processes. How realistic do you think it is that we're going to see significant increases in migrant removals from Germany? And what sort of social implications?

00:17:43 Speaker 1

You anticipate that this might have, especially considering the description that you just gave us of the the changing nature of the demography of Germany.

00:17:52

Yes.

00:17:53 Speaker 3

Well, Germany is confronted with that mismatch. They are signalling that they are going to push for harder migration policies, but in fact they need to just go ahead with a kind of maybe invisible open migration policy, which has been happening already within the past.

00:18:12 Speaker 3

Last years, so none of the upcoming parties can afford to be very strong on anti immigration due to the factors that I have. I've been just telling you. I mean we have the baby boomers in mainly all the key sectors of the labour market. They are 55 years and plus. So within the next 10 years they are going to retire.

00:18:36 Speaker 3

We already have the data for several labour market positions and I'm not only talking about the shortages that we are already facing, that is mainly.

00:18:47 Speaker 3

In the care sector and also in the teaching sector. So Germany is in terrible need for teachers for care workers, for doctors. But not only that, I mean, Germany also needs bus drivers. This is actually one of the shortages that has been announced. It needs, like, I don't know, Rd.

00:19:07 Speaker 3

Internal maintenance workers, so they they are there for the road safety for winter services and for Rd maintenance. So they need in the meat processing sector it's.

00:19:18 Speaker 3

That Germany has been like kind of telling the story of high skilled immigrant policies for a decade. And since the corona pandemic, they have been clear that it's not only a need for high skilled workers, but mainly for relevant skilled workers, which shifts the.

00:19:38 Speaker 3

Story than narrative away from higher educated people that have a university degree.

00:19:45 Speaker 3

These are the people Germany wants. Well, no. Germany actually also needs nannies and lorry drivers like the UK, I suppose. And so there is a kind of competition going on secretly within all the European countries that have these demographic shifts and need those, let's say, relevant skilled workers who can be.

00:20:06 Speaker 3

Low skilled and non skilled worker.

00:20:09 Speaker 3

And on the other side, they tell their public that the only thing they want is this kind of story of the past decades of these high skilled immigrants and what I want to mention is it's not only the classical immigration countries that are shifting demographic changes.

00:20:28 Speaker 3

And open up their sectors for more.

00:20:31 Speaker 3

Immigration. It's also Japan, and it's also South Korea. So suddenly we have a trade in of different competing countries that we never had in mind as countries who would actually compete with the global European North in terms of migration.

00:20:50 Speaker 1

A super interesting answer and I was expecting to be talking about Germany going harder on migration policy, but actually you're describing like something a little bit more complex than that.

00:21:00 Speaker 1

Which is a sort of disconnect between I suppose the the political narrative and the political realities of what needs to happen and what potentially will happen. So Terry, can I just ask you a slightly more, a slightly more nuanced question than my rather blunt one, which I was going to put, which was about how the rest of Europe would deal if Germany.

00:21:21 Speaker 1

Did start to introduce much more hardline anti immigration policies and ask you what do you think?

00:21:27 Speaker 1

The rest of the what do you think the relationship between German policy making more broadly on migration issues and the rest of Europe is whether or not Germany does go harder or Germany does find itself desperately competing as Nike has described with other countries to bring in, you know, medium skilled workers to do jobs such as mending roads and driving.

00:21:48 Speaker 1

Process.

00:21:49 Speaker 4

So I think it's helpful to distinguish labour markets or labour migration policies from policies in asylum toward.

00:21:59 Speaker 4

And where we've already seen a very clear shift to the right, is everything around asylum, refugee Reed ethnicity of policies in in in immigration. So it's not an if question. Germany has fundamentally moved to the right or ready historically.

00:22:19 Speaker 4

Right, the the basic rights to asylum is currently being challenged in a way that it hadn't been before, so that the move has already happened and now we can ask, of course, what consequences does this have? And it has policy and and and politics consequences in terms of policies. Once Germany starts doing this.

00:22:38 Speaker 4

This really opens the door for ever harder policies nearly everywhere in the European Union, right? Many of these countries have moved right before Germany already and under America. And you can say about her what you want. But there really had an effect of still keeping the old.

00:22:58 Speaker 4

European Union status quo around this in place and this is now, it's not threatened. It's already being eroded with many policies at the European and at the nation.

00:23:09 Speaker 4

Level. Now the politics consequences of this, the idea of political actors is very often to think we have to do this to decrease support for the far right.

00:23:21 Speaker 4

Right. We have to move on immigration. We have to get this solved somehow in quotation marks. We have done a lot of research on this. It is very clear moving to the right and.

00:23:30 Speaker 4

Vision does not weaken the far right. If you take one thing of what I've said today, it is this one. It does not work and the short one. If anything, it strengthens these parties. It is very clear that in the long run it does. It legitimises these parties. It normalises these parties. We see that in many countries they're already.

00:23:50 Speaker 4

Cannibalising the far right, the especially the mainstream right Christian Democrats.

00:23:56 Speaker 4

Conservatives are becoming the smaller party on the right, and this happens especially when they've opened that door to the far right, especially on the issue of immigration, but also other cultural issues. So the politics consequences of these shifts to the right are to make the far right even stronger and then being in this vicious circle.

00:24:16 Speaker 4

Of thinking you have to ever move further to the right, we're in the middle of this. This is not a hypothetical.

00:24:22 Speaker 1

This is super interesting. Your description Tariq of if Germany does it, it legitimises it elsewhere. You know, I mean it feels a little bit like this is a conversation we've had in the UK and if we look at, for example, the Rwanda policy discussions about leaving the European Convention on Human Rights and other sort of policy decisions that are being put forward as.

00:24:42 Speaker 1

Kind of in inverted commas. Solutions to migration issues which are, you know, perceived to be, you know, particularly radical and pandering to a certain right wing, perspectives on things. It feels like every country.

00:24:56 Speaker 1

Is wrapped up in a kind of complex debate about this kind of thing, and that there is an ongoing process by which we are all sort of participating in it. In this process of kind of of eroding a kind of liberal status quo. Would you agree that that's the way that things are going and is there a way of?

00:25:16 Speaker 1

Turning that around or is it just what is happening and we have to do?

00:25:21 Speaker 4

So yes, so there is this, this vicious cycle that we've actually studied quite well. But usually the first mover is the far right becomes a more successful political actor. So these parties gain votes, they gain representation in Parliament. What we know then is that mainstream parties, established parties react to this.

00:25:41 Speaker 4

By moving right on immigration as a strategic reaction, they try to win these voters back and we have very good evidence on this.

00:25:50 Speaker 4

That doesn't help though, so in the the first consequence is not that it weakens the radical right, but actually the the voters aren't coming back at the same time. What is happening is that there's a top down process where these issues become more salient. They become more politicised, and also from basically the whole political spectrum.

00:26:11 Speaker 4

What people here is, you know, we have to deport more people. There's this, this, this competition around tougher and tougher policies around asylum and immigration.

00:26:21 Speaker 4

So people adjust their opinions on these issues. They find they they see these issues as more salient and they become more anti immigrant as a reaction to these narratives. And now even politicians who in the beginning didn't react to the far right, they now say, well, look at these polls, look at the numbers. It's the whole public that's now against immigration. So clearly the Greens are doing this, for example, at the moment in Germany.

00:26:44 Speaker 4

So clearly we also have to move to the right on immigration. So there you really have this vicious cycle that has very much to do with the strategic response to the far right.

00:26:54 Speaker 4

And the the only way to break this is to to change the discourse to be, you know, confident progressives and make a case for more progressive migration policies, even if that in the current situation may come at short term cost selectively.

00:27:11 Speaker 1

Nika, would you broadly agree with that? Would you describe that as a way forward or do you think that there are other ways that, that these challenges can be?

00:27:18 Speaker 1

Dressed.

00:27:19 Speaker 3

Actually, I totally agree with Tarek in his analysis and obviously we can't see the right wing shift in migration policies. I mean the FDA, they have already articulated their Ray migration plan, how they call it. So within the 1st.

00:27:38 Speaker 3

100 days to come if they would be part of the government and they are actually not planning for this elections in 2025, but they are are planning for elections in 2033.

00:27:57 Speaker 3

Actually, so this is a kind of symbolic factor they're planning to get into power in 2033 and they have ahead the Berlin Olympics in 2036. And so also the ID with that immigration plan that has to be scheduled within the 1st 100 days to come.

00:28:17 Speaker 3

Like Trump's idea of just getting as much immigrants out of the country as he can, he's talking about irregular migrants. But we we have to see what he's going to do. But we know As for the ID, their plan is to get.

00:28:32 Speaker 3

Let those immigrants out of the country who do not integrate culturally, whatever they would, this will mean in the next decade.

00:28:49 Speaker 3

But what we can see and what we have to face and what we have to be clear about, is that they are not going to rebuild this kind of Germany 1933 Nazi Deutschland somehow. Yes, but all even the ID will be in need of immigrant.

00:29:09 Speaker 3

So what they will do mainly, and I would say this is what we are going to face throughout Europe within the next 10 years, we're not going to get rid of the immigrants, we're going to be Europe like a like an idea of dealing with immigration, how the Saudi Arabians do or the how the United Arab.

00:29:29 Speaker 3

Emirate.

00:29:30 Speaker 3

So so it will be a country where we have a lot of immigrants, but they will be at best second class or third class citizens. Obviously this country will have a primary folk that will be there on the top. And this thing I think this will be the policy of the European Union, they will have immigrants.

00:29:50 Speaker 3

Coming in, but they will not grant them the liberal idea that was driving Europe within the past decades. This idea of equality, wherever you come from this promise of.

00:30:02 Speaker 3

Longing it will be a utilitarian shift where immigrants can have a good life. They can be good doctors, they can be rich, they can study, but they will not form part of the national collective. That was the idea of Europe after the Second World War.

00:30:13 Speaker 1

Wow, I had said it's been an absolutely fascinating conversation.

00:30:25 Speaker 3



So maybe we can close on a kind of more policy oriented, let's say, not optimistic. But like Tarek, he already was showing what the parties would need to do if they want to save a liberal Europe. So maybe I could say, you know, normally we were directing our policy remarks.

00:30:46 Speaker 3

Always with an idea on how Canada is doing it. Well, actually we all see that Canada is under a high pressure at the moment and is already already changing its open migration policies. But I would say As for Germany.

00:31:03 Speaker 3

Germany has in fact evolved into these key migration actor, but still its policies are lacking behind so Germany has no real structured migration policy. So I would say Germany, but it really needs to do first within.

00:31:23 Speaker 3

The next legislative period is we need a migration and integration and Refugee ministry.

00:31:32 Speaker 3

We don't even have that, so our migration policy is coming from a lot of different kind of ministries like the Ministry of Labour, Interior, Families Affairs and you can see that there is a kind of, let's say, lack of communication. It's not a coherent.

00:31:52 Speaker 3

Migration policy, so this would be the first thing to do. So I would say we we need to we as experts as scientifics as migration scholars.

00:32:04 Speaker 3

Have to get more involved in bringing like kind of concrete, measurable and doable plans to the politicians. I do believe As for me, I can say I've been working a lot on the grand narratives within the past decades and now I should focus on the little little small steps that politicians could do.

00:32:24 Speaker 3

Before we face a shutdown on migration.

00:32:28 Speaker 1

There's so much more that we could say about this. It's an it's been a genuinely fascinating conversation, and I'm enormously grateful to both of you for for sharing your time and your expertise with us. But let me let me just say thank you to you, Tarek, and to you. Nika. It's been really, really interesting. Thank you so much.

00:32:44 Speaker 2

You've been listening to the Migration Oxford Podcast. I'm Jackie broadhead.

00:32:47 Speaker 1

And I'm rob MacNeil.