

## **Podcast 2: Partnerships in Global Health**

Proochista and Caesar discuss the importance of fair and equitable partnerships in an interdependent global health space. Are partnerships silencing the voices of some people? The podcast also looks at the attributes of partnerships - competence, accountability and reliability, that make them trustworthy.

**Speakers:** Professor Proochista Ariana and Professor Caesar Atuire

**Professor Proochista Ariana** is the Course Director for the MSc in International Health and Tropical Medicine, IHTM at the University of Oxford. Proochista holds a Master's in International Health from Harvard University and a Doctorate in International Development from University of Oxford, as well as a Post Graduate Diploma in Learning and Teaching in Higher Education, also from Oxford.

**Professor Caesar Atuire** is a philosopher and health ethicist from Ghana and the Ethics Lead for the MSc in International Health and Tropical Medicine, IHTM at the University of Oxford. Caesar is also an Associate Professor of Applied Philosophy at the Department of Philosophy and Classics at the University of Ghana and an affiliate Instructor at the University of Washington's Department of Bioethics and Humanities.

**Key words:** Partnerships, Global Health, International Health and Tropical Medicine, University of Oxford, Centre for Tropical Medicine and Global Health, Nuffield Department of Medicine

1

00:00:10,460 --> 00:00:15,680

Hello and welcome to the International Health and Tropical Medicine Podcast series.

2

00:00:19,180 --> 00:00:26,170

My name is Proochista Ariana, and I'm here with my colleague and friend Cesar Attuire.

3

00:00:26,980 --> 00:00:33,010

Today the topic of our podcast will be Partnerships in Global Health.

4

00:00:33,580 --> 00:00:37,690

This picks up on our last podcast on decolonisation,

5

00:00:38,020 --> 00:00:47,620

where we talked about needing to co-create knowledge and the need to have equity within the partnerships.

6

00:00:48,010 --> 00:00:54,850

So to begin with, let me ask Cesar. Why do we need equitable partnerships in global health?

7

00:00:55,780 --> 00:01:02,770

I think global health by nature and by definition, because it is transnational,

8

00:01:02,800 --> 00:01:13,870

it affects issues that deal with health across the globe, requires partnerships because there's a lot of interdependence.

9

00:01:14,590 --> 00:01:24,400

Even some of our greatest, most advanced scientific interventions usually require collaboration.

10

00:01:25,550 --> 00:01:30,990

That begins some days with collecting data in one part of the world.

11

00:01:32,430 --> 00:01:40,379

Analysing it in another part of the world and creating a health intervention which is perhaps produced in another part of the world.

12

00:01:40,380 --> 00:01:48,780

So partnerships in terms of coming together and working together is the order of the day.

13

00:01:50,460 --> 00:01:53,580

Now this brings us to the issue of interdependence.

14

00:01:54,300 --> 00:02:04,860

One of the greatest achievements of the 20th century in the so called phenomenon of globalisation is an increase in interdependence.

15

00:02:05,760 --> 00:02:16,950

It's interesting that if any of us think about the medicines that we have consumed in the past 12 months and we look at the labels,

16

00:02:17,910 --> 00:02:27,810

we'd see that they come from different parts of the world. Now the issue at stake here is if there is so much interdependence.

17

00:02:29,060 --> 00:02:32,330

Which is usually formalised into partnerships.

18

00:02:34,500 --> 00:02:37,860

Are these partnerships equal?

19

00:02:39,180 --> 00:02:43,980

Are they skewed in a way that some people benefit more and others less?

20

00:02:44,820 --> 00:02:51,570

Are they silencing the voices of some people or actually even to be more radical,

21

00:02:52,230 --> 00:02:56,460

Are they actually, you know, practising a form of extractivism?

22

00:02:57,800 --> 00:03:03,750

By, if I may put it crudely, cheating some people.

23

00:03:04,020 --> 00:03:07,290

So that is why the equity comes into it.

24

00:03:07,680 --> 00:03:14,400

As for the partnerships, they already exist. But are these partnerships good for everybody?

25

00:03:16,350 --> 00:03:21,920

Do people get their due? And that is why we need equitable partnerships.

26

00:03:22,340 --> 00:03:28,400

Can you give us some history behind how partnerships have existed in the space

27

00:03:28,670 --> 00:03:34,190

of global health and how we're evolving in thinking about those partnerships?

28

00:03:34,790 --> 00:03:47,240

Well, I think, I mean, if we look at it from history, going back to the beginning, a lot of health was situated within the colonial era.

29

00:03:47,600 --> 00:03:52,250

I mean, a lot of international health was predicated on the colonial system.

30

00:03:53,060 --> 00:04:01,380

But, once we started moving to international health, it was more about aid to countries that are poorer.

31

00:04:02,310 --> 00:04:10,260

And if I want to give some examples, let's talk about the AIDS pandemic in the 1990s.

32

00:04:11,490 --> 00:04:19,680

As you know, parts of the United States suffered a lot, especially in California, San Francisco, around there, many people were dying.

33

00:04:20,010 --> 00:04:24,660

There was need to generate a lot of knowledge about this new disease.

34

00:04:25,290 --> 00:04:30,120

And people in Southern Africa, were also getting infected.

35

00:04:30,780 --> 00:04:40,829

And a lot of data was gathered from the populations of Southern Africa in order to be able to create the antiretrovirals that eventually emerged but

36

00:04:40,830 --> 00:04:49,559

The fact is that when these antiretrovirals were created and were generated, they were totally inaccessible to the people in South Africa,

37

00:04:49,560 --> 00:04:59,460

in the Southern part of Africa, who had contributed, with their lives, basically, and their illness, to generating these solutions.

38

00:04:59,470 --> 00:05:05,700

So we create, we have these situations whereby we depend on certain people to be able to acquire knowledge.

39

00:05:06,030 --> 00:05:11,190

But when that knowledge becomes a health intervention, these people have no access to it.

40

00:05:12,090 --> 00:05:17,150

And it had to, I mean, it took the intervention of many people, including international

41

00:05:17,280 --> 00:05:22,800

bodies like the U.N. to be able to make these antiretrovirals available to people in Southern Africa.

42

00:05:23,100 --> 00:05:27,839

So in synthesis, yes, we do have a lot of interdependence, but equity is needed.

43

00:05:27,840 --> 00:05:34,560

Otherwise, this sort of interdependence can damage some people while playing to the advantage of others.

44

00:05:35,160 --> 00:05:45,120

I think that's right. And that both in the health space and outside of health, we have often and historically seen an imbalance in partnerships.

45

00:05:45,480 --> 00:05:50,940

And perhaps that's what we're trying to encourage moving forward in the

46

00:05:50,940 --> 00:05:56,100

global health space, thinking about the equity and equitable partnerships.

47

00:05:56,400 --> 00:06:02,370

Can you outline for us some of the key features of equitable partnerships?

48

00:06:03,480 --> 00:06:13,410

Well, I think, when we want to talk about equitable partnerships, first of all, allow me to make a distinction.

49

00:06:15,810 --> 00:06:21,990

From the way I see this, partnerships should become a way of being, equitable

50

00:06:21,990 --> 00:06:26,460

partnerships should become a way of being. We already live in a world in which we depend on each other.

51

00:06:26,910 --> 00:06:34,710

We should be cognisant of that and give respect to the people, to everybody who forms part of this space.

52

00:06:35,610 --> 00:06:38,399

That means that when we're thinking about partnerships,

53

00:06:38,400 --> 00:06:45,030

we should not only be thinking about partnerships in terms of a sort of instrumental approach.

54

00:06:45,390 --> 00:06:51,890

I want to do this. Who can help me to do this? And it is my idea that I want to do this and I want to build partners.

55

00:06:51,890 --> 00:06:56,640

So we are already tied together. We are already interdependent, and there's no way we can get out of this.

56

00:06:57,000 --> 00:07:06,180

Now, how can we make this space fairer? So there is the premise then to make this space fairer, we need to say,

57

00:07:06,180 --> 00:07:11,220

well, these partnerships that we've created, what are the power imbalances?

58

00:07:12,600 --> 00:07:20,070

Does everybody in this space have the capacity to express themselves,

59

00:07:20,670 --> 00:07:27,180

the capacity to enjoy the benefits that are generated as a result of our coming together?

60

00:07:29,130 --> 00:07:32,880

equal access to those benefits. And, of course.

61

00:07:34,470 --> 00:07:41,970

Also, I mean, recognise that those who have a lot of power may even inadvertently

62

00:07:43,380 --> 00:07:47,490

Be crushing other people, which is what historically has happened.

63

00:07:48,090 --> 00:07:55,170

And therefore, how can we unlock these spaces so that other people may be able to breathe more freely?

64

00:07:55,800 --> 00:08:05,640

And could I add to that, the idea that we have different values and we need to extend our thinking around

65

00:08:05,880 --> 00:08:13,560

whose values matter and what values should be considered when thinking about that balance within a partnership.

66

00:08:13,860 --> 00:08:16,860

Absolutely. And I think you're absolutely right there.

67

00:08:16,890 --> 00:08:23,790

And this is where looking back or thinking back to our previous podcast, we spoke about the pluriverse.

68

00:08:26,250 --> 00:08:34,990

The interesting thing about a complex world like the one in which we live is that people do have different values.

69

00:08:35,010 --> 00:08:40,260

People have different ways of understanding how they live in this world.

70

00:08:40,620 --> 00:08:45,480

That is, the ways of being, and ways of knowing and ways of acting and.

71

00:08:46,670 --> 00:08:51,680

We should be careful about just saying that. Well, this is the right way and this is the wrong way.

72

00:08:52,490 --> 00:08:53,980

We need to,

73

00:08:53,990 --> 00:09:10,399

take seriously these differences and ensure that there is sort of, the mutuality of these differences that can contribute to what we all desire now,

74

00:09:10,400 --> 00:09:17,090

What we all desire. Yes. Broadly speaking, we all know that everybody wants some form of wellbeing.

75

00:09:17,660 --> 00:09:25,980

Everybody wants to be healthy. But then that way of being healthy, that way of actually living out the wellbeing, differs.

76

00:09:26,870 --> 00:09:34,060

And we ought to be respectful of that and actually allow people to be able to expect to, to, pursue those goals.

77

00:09:34,070 --> 00:09:40,750

We should not predetermine and force people to live according to the way we want them to live.

78

00:09:40,760 --> 00:09:45,800

And that is what I mean, partnerships and equitable partnerships should be looking at.

79

00:09:46,700 --> 00:09:54,620

But I mean, coming back to the global health space. So one of the areas that I find quite troubling is that sometimes we say, well.

80

00:09:55,750 --> 00:10:03,730

Equitable partnerships. And we start looking at, you know, the funding space, the research space, and.

81

00:10:05,980 --> 00:10:16,000

It is about a certain checklist that we need to create where the data is being shared, where the postdocs are

82

00:10:16,000 --> 00:10:23,500

being included and are being trained, whether capacity building has been included in a certain project.

83

00:10:24,070 --> 00:10:33,850

But then we don't do the detailed work of what these terms actually mean in different places and to different people.

84

00:10:34,360 --> 00:10:37,959

Can I take you a step back and come back to the key features?

85

00:10:37,960 --> 00:10:46,320

And one feature that I think many would articulate is this aspect of trust, but trust is hard to interpret.

86

00:10:46,330 --> 00:10:51,460

Can you, can you elaborate on what trust means in the context of partnerships?

87

00:10:52,030 --> 00:10:52,640

Right.

88

00:10:52,660 --> 00:11:03,070

Trust as an abstract concept is nice, and we, we often say, oh, these days there is no trust, but actually these days there's too much trust.

89

00:11:03,160 --> 00:11:07,030

If I may, if I may dare say, because sometimes we trust the wrong people.

90

00:11:08,020 --> 00:11:15,410

So what we really need is trustworthiness and trustworthiness

91

00:11:15,490 --> 00:11:26,050

means that, we need to have partners that engage according to three features.

92

00:11:26,470 --> 00:11:37,840

The first feature of trustworthiness is to be competent, and competence means actually recognising that when you enter into a relationship,

93

00:11:38,410 --> 00:11:48,040

different people bring different competencies and whatever competencies they bring, we should take them seriously, taking them seriously.

94

00:11:48,460 --> 00:11:54,820

And as we go along, you see that we will hold them to account for those competencies.

95

00:11:54,820 --> 00:11:59,590

But it is not by saying that one person only has the competencies and is going to

96

00:11:59,590 --> 00:12:03,160

share those competencies or is going to impose those competencies on the other.

97

00:12:03,430 --> 00:12:10,780

That is not taking seriously the other side. So that is the first condition for, for trust, which is competence.

98

00:12:11,260 --> 00:12:20,650

The second condition to be able to build trusting, trustworthy relationships is to be reliable,

99

00:12:21,940 --> 00:12:30,280

to say, to do what we say and to be reliable over time.

100

00:12:30,910 --> 00:12:38,350

So quite often what we find in the global health space and even in the international collaboration space is that at the beginning,

101

00:12:38,350 --> 00:12:43,780

for example, we insist on certain values or we are all in this together.

102

00:12:43,780 --> 00:12:48,520

Let's share our data. Let's make everything open.

103

00:12:50,050 --> 00:12:57,550

But then as we go along, if this research is maturing into a health intervention,

104

00:12:57,910 --> 00:13:04,389

another set of values kick in and we start talking about private ownership,

105

00:13:04,390 --> 00:13:11,320

intellectual property rights and that openness that was predicated at the beginning suddenly gets lost.

106

00:13:12,010 --> 00:13:12,999

Now, when you do this,

107

00:13:13,000 --> 00:13:22,540

you are no longer reliable because you came to me or we came together with a certain set of values to work together and to be together.

108

00:13:23,020 --> 00:13:26,739

But now that something is coming out, those rules,

109

00:13:26,740 --> 00:13:29,740

those values are suddenly changing. We no longer want to share.

110

00:13:30,070 --> 00:13:34,270

So that challenges reliability. So we need to be consistent and reliable.

111

00:13:34,810 --> 00:13:40,480

And then the last aspect of trustworthiness is to be accountable.

112

00:13:41,500 --> 00:13:49,370

And to be accountable means that, you know, we have to be able to give account,

113

00:13:49,390 --> 00:14:00,220

accountability, that is to explain and make ourselves vulnerable, to be challenged by everybody involved.

114

00:14:00,820 --> 00:14:07,210

So if I am doing research and I'm even working with communities and working,

115

00:14:07,390 --> 00:14:14,200

I should be accountable to those communities and therefore I should allow myself to be challenged.

116

00:14:15,070 --> 00:14:24,940

So if we do not take into consideration that we need to be competent and respect the competencies of other people,

117

00:14:25,810 --> 00:14:34,480

That we are reliable, which means we say we do what we say over time and allow ourselves some amount of vulnerability.

118

00:14:35,620 --> 00:14:42,280

Then we can't build trust in our relationships and therefore we can't build equitable partnerships.

119

00:14:43,240 --> 00:14:50,650

And I think that issue of competence and related to accountability also relates to knowing the limits of our knowledge.

120

00:14:50,800 --> 00:14:57,190

Absolutely. Yes. So this is also linked to, you know, power sometimes.

121

00:14:59,230 --> 00:15:04,300

You know, the important thing is actually admitting that we do not know.

122

00:15:04,510 --> 00:15:13,480

It's important. I mean, if I'm going back to global health research, if I go into a community as a researcher,

123

00:15:13,510 --> 00:15:19,870

whether I'm a biomedical research or an epidemiologist, then there are limits to what I know.

124

00:15:20,680 --> 00:15:25,210

But the limits to what I know does not mean that other people do not know anything.

125

00:15:25,750 --> 00:15:35,950

You see, that is the positivistic approach. I, I can't be an expert on everything, but if I'm entering into a relationship,

126

00:15:35,950 --> 00:15:41,349

a partnership with another group of people, it is precisely because I do not know everything.

127

00:15:41,350 --> 00:15:50,080

That is why I actually need other people and I need to be cognisant of those limits and respect what those other people bring on board as well.

128

00:15:50,770 --> 00:16:01,900

However, if I am not cognisant of the limits of my knowledge and I believe that anything outside the limits of my knowledge is simply irrelevant,

129

00:16:02,740 --> 00:16:06,280

then I'm a positivist and in that way I'm a reductionist.

130

00:16:06,880 --> 00:16:10,330

And actually, if I may be crude about it, I'm ignorant.

131

00:16:10,620 --> 00:16:18,070

So kind of bringing it back to the importance of equitable partnerships in research.

132

00:16:18,580 --> 00:16:22,420

What would you say is the key message you'd like to convey?

133

00:16:23,800 --> 00:16:29,170

The key message is this. We live in an interdependent world.

134

00:16:32,770 --> 00:16:43,450

Health is now more and more transnational and interdependent in order to tackle the health challenges we have.

135

00:16:43,600 --> 00:16:46,780

We need to work together now.

136

00:16:46,810 --> 00:16:53,170

Unfortunately, health also sits on the structures that already exist in the world,

137

00:16:53,170 --> 00:17:03,790

and these structures that exist in the world are predicated sometimes on extractivism or they are predicated on forms of colonialism from the past,

138

00:17:03,790 --> 00:17:06,310

and that still continues today.

139

00:17:07,060 --> 00:17:15,490

So if we do not want to reinforce or re entrench those inequities, we need to move away from those models.

140

00:17:15,490 --> 00:17:24,100

And to move away from those models means that we should try to build relationships that are different to the ones that are generally at play.

141

00:17:24,670 --> 00:17:27,720

And in doing so, what we need to do is, one,

142

00:17:27,730 --> 00:17:39,820

respect other people's knowledge and values, and values, and at the same time not think of partnerships as instrumental moments,

143

00:17:40,270 --> 00:17:46,360

but as a permanent way of acting and living within the global health space.

144

00:17:46,870 --> 00:17:49,090

So we are partners with everybody,

145

00:17:49,780 --> 00:17:56,680

and our partnerships should be grounded on the fact that we want to create a world in which we trust each other.

146

00:17:56,860 --> 00:18:01,089

And that trust means respecting, being competent and respecting our competencies,

147

00:18:01,090 --> 00:18:06,610

being reliable over time, and also making ourselves vulnerable when the need arises.

148

00:18:07,960 --> 00:18:09,130

Thank you very much, Cesar,

149

00:18:09,130 --> 00:18:16,900

for that very important discussion and consideration and the key questions and considerations we'd like our listeners to take

150

00:18:16,900 --> 00:18:26,800

away is when engaging in partnerships in global health or otherwise, seriously consider and respect competencies and values.

151

00:18:27,220 --> 00:18:30,220

Carefully consider benefit sharing,

152

00:18:30,550 --> 00:18:36,730

and avoid this tendency to be extractive in the partnerships or relationships

153

00:18:36,730 --> 00:18:42,940

that we develop and this importance of the reliability and accountability.

154

00:18:43,270 --> 00:18:53,500

And that's our responsibility. So our next podcast will be looking at breaking down barriers in global health.

155

00:18:54,730 --> 00:18:55,900

Thank you for joining us.