

Transcript

00:00:14 Speaker 1

So welcome everyone to the third talk in the third series of our Padmasambhava Udayana and Tibet seminar.

00:00:21 Speaker 1

We've enjoyed an excellent programme, this Hilary term.

00:00:24 Speaker 1

You can find the details on our website.

00:00:26 Speaker 1

And we still have one more talk to come on the 11th of March.

00:00:31 Speaker 1

All our talks are published as video podcasts.

00:00:33 Speaker 1

They're freely available from our website, from Apple Podcasts, and from many other sites too.

00:00:39 Speaker 1

So please try not to interrupt during the recording.

00:00:44 Speaker 1

However, the discussion periods after the talks will not be podcast and are open to the entire audience, so please feel free to express yourselves and to ask questions then.

00:00:56 Speaker 1

Today we are delighted to welcome Dr.

00:00:58 Speaker 1

Ben Williams.

00:01:00 Speaker 1

Ben Williams is an intellectual historian focused on South Asian religions and the history of Shaiva Tantra.

00:01:07 Speaker 1

He's received extensive training in Indian philosophy, literature and aesthetics in Sanskrit sources and completed his PhD in the Department of South Asian Studies at Harvard University.

00:01:19 Speaker 1

Ben is currently

00:01:22 Speaker 1

an associate professor of Hinduism at Naropa University and serves as the faculty lead for Naropa's MA program in yoga studies.

00:01:30 Speaker 1

In 2025, he became the first scholar in residence for the Mukta Bodha Indological Research Institute, where he is guiding a number of initiatives related to preservation of Sanskrit texts.

00:01:43 Speaker 1

This position coincides with the funding of a Mukta Bodha Chair of Yoga Studies at Naropa University, which Ben will hold until spring 2028.

00:01:52 Speaker 1

Ben has published a number of articles and book chapters, including several on Abhinavagupta, and has also produced a number of translations from the Sanskrit, including Amrita Nanda's Chitvila Chitvilas Chitvilasastava, or Hymn to the Play of Consciousness, and Shivananda's Sulbhagya Hridayashtotra, or Praise to the Heart of Auspiciousness.

00:02:14 Speaker 1

Ben also has two books forthcoming, one of them entitled The Sutras of Shiva, a new edition and annotated translation of the Shiva Sutra Bhimarshini, and the other, Hymns of the Kaula Lineage, critical editions, translations, and studies from early modern Kashmir.

00:02:30 Speaker 1

I should add, Ben is a close associate of our previous speaker, John Nemetz.

00:02:34 Speaker 1

He gave us such a wonderful and erudite talk on Kashmir and Shaivism around the late 8th century on February 11th.

00:02:40 Speaker 1

So it's great to have this continuity.

00:02:42 Speaker 1

Thank you very much, Ben, for coming and talking to us.

00:02:45 Speaker 1

And over to you.

00:02:47 Speaker 2

Great.

00:02:47 Speaker 2

Thank you so much, Rob.

00:02:48 Speaker 2

Thank you, Rob and Kathy, for the invitation to join this series.

00:02:53 Speaker 2

And I just want to share my appreciation for the way that

00:02:57 Speaker 2

This lecture series has brought together Tibetologists and Indologists, people working on Tibetan Buddhism and Shivanshakta Tantra.

00:03:04 Speaker 2

It's such an important intersection of research.

00:03:07 Speaker 2

I want to also begin with a few acknowledgments.

00:03:10 Speaker 2

One is to John Nemek.

00:03:11 Speaker 2

As Rob mentioned, he's a close colleague, and his talk really inspired this talk.

00:03:17 Speaker 2

I'm looking at the next two centuries of what's happening in the region of Kashmir and Swat Valley.

00:03:24 Speaker 2

And John

00:03:26 Speaker 2

explored a lot of geographical, political, and archaeological resources in his talk.

00:03:33 Speaker 2

And so he's inspired me to look at those sources as well.

00:03:37 Speaker 2

In some ways, that's going beyond my wheelhouse, which is as a textual scholar.

00:03:42 Speaker 2

So I might be a little on unsteady footing in some of that material, but I just want to begin with an appreciation for John and also just he's been an incredible encouragement

00:03:57 Speaker 2

He's been an encouragement for me over the years.

00:04:00 Speaker 2

I also want to acknowledge Alexis Sanderson.

00:04:04 Speaker 2

A lot of what I'm going to be focusing on is deeply indebted to his foundational work on the history of the Shakta lineage called the Krama.

00:04:12 Speaker 2

And there's an anecdote I once heard, I think it might have been from Don Davidson, that the entire last century of scholarship on Dharma Shastra

00:04:25 Speaker 2

is footnotes to the work of P.V.

00:04:28 Speaker 2

Kane, who wrote the History of Dharmashastra, volumes one and two.

00:04:34 Speaker 2

And I think the same could probably be said about Alexis Anderson.

00:04:38 Speaker 2

The last 30 years of scholarship, in some ways, the next 30 years of scholarship will be footnotes on his monumental contributions.

00:04:49 Speaker 2

I also want to acknowledge Adam Krug, who recently published

00:04:54 Speaker 2

This book, The Seven City Texts, Mahamuja Instructions from the Odiyana Mahasiddhas.

00:05:01 Speaker 2

In preparation for this talk, I read this book closely.

00:05:04 Speaker 2

I met with Adam twice, and his scholarship and his work is really informing some of the comparative things I'll do.

00:05:13 Speaker 2

And finally, Luca Olivieri in the Italian Archaeological Mission in Pakistan has been

00:05:20 Speaker 2

of their scholarship, especially archaeological research, has been incredibly useful for this talk.

00:05:28 Speaker 2

All right, are you ready?

00:05:30 Speaker 2

Great.

00:05:32 Speaker 2

So first of all, Udiyana and the Shaka lineages of the Krama is the name of the talk.

00:05:38 Speaker 2

So I'm going to be looking at the Swat Valley in Kashmir predominantly in the 9th to 10th centuries.

00:05:44 Speaker 2

The plan of the talk is that I'm going to be looking at this 13th century travelogue of Organpah

00:05:50 Speaker 2

which was originally translated by Giuseppe Tucci.

00:05:54 Speaker 2

That's going to kind of create a setting to then look at the political, archaeological, and inscriptural evidence of Swat Valley during this time period.

00:06:03 Speaker 2

And then I want to look at some textual sources, early Krama sources, and some Vajrayana Buddhist sources that identify themselves with Udayana.

00:06:12 Speaker 2

And I'm calling that section a kind of look at what we might call the textual corpus of Udayana.

00:06:18 Speaker 2

And

00:06:19 Speaker 2

What I'm really trying to show is that the Krama tradition, some of its earliest sources identify themselves with Udayana, and those traditions come to flourish most significantly for centuries within Kashmir, following those early revelations.

00:06:38 Speaker 2

And Sanderson has made a really compelling argument that the Udayana of those early sources is the Swat Valley in Pakistan, which is not far west of Kashmir, the Vale of Kashmir.

00:06:50 Speaker 2

And so I'm going to kind of articulate Sanderson's argument and then add some more evidence to support that and really explore the role of Udayana in these early Krama sources as an actual

00:07:09 Speaker 2

landscape, as an actual geographical location.

00:07:13 Speaker 2

It's pretty clear in the early history of Shakta Tantra that Udayana comes to be more of a symbolic place.

00:07:20 Speaker 2

It becomes mapped onto different geographies.

00:07:23 Speaker 2

It's mapped onto the body.

00:07:25 Speaker 2

And it also comes to be described as a kind of state of consciousness in a lot of different texts.

00:07:30 Speaker 2

So there's a kind of tension between a kind of

00:07:35 Speaker 2

a toponym, a geographical location, and then an ideal location that can be projected into different places that I'm going to be exploring.

00:07:45 Speaker 2

So in this travelogue, this itinerary of Orgyenpa, this Tibetan work, it's an extraordinary document.

00:07:53 Speaker 2

I just want to highlight some of the things that this Tibetan pilgrim describes when he travels to Udayana.

00:07:59 Speaker 2

Again, this is summarized in Sanderson, it's referenced a lot, and it's translated by Tucci.

00:08:06 Speaker 2

So he describes his journey to Swat Valley, which he calls Udiyana.

00:08:12 Speaker 2

He goes through Malot, which is in the Punjab province of modern Pakistan, and in the kind of salt range, we'll speak about this region in a moment.

00:08:25 Speaker 2

And he reaches a place called Rajahura, and he describes it as one of the four gates to Udiyana.

00:08:32 Speaker 2

And this is

00:08:34 Speaker 2

very close to the Indus River.

00:08:39 Speaker 2

He receives a letter from a Raja Deva, which gives him permission to proceed to the holy place of Dhumat.

00:08:49 Speaker 2

Orgyanpa sees Dhumat as the kind of core of Udiyana.

00:08:53 Speaker 2

He passes by a mountain, Ilo, which has been identified subsequently as

00:09:00 Speaker 2

Ilam Mountain, which is near Barakot in the Swat Valley.

00:09:03 Speaker 2

And then he reaches a place he calls Rayakar, which he describes as the capital of the King Indrabuti.

00:09:13 Speaker 2

And he mentions 2 towns there.

00:09:15 Speaker 2

And to the north, he says there's a town, and he calls it Magalore or Mangalore.

00:09:22 Speaker 2

And in it, he says there's a temple founded by Indrabuti.

00:09:26 Speaker 2

and also various images in stone of the Buddha, Tara, and Lokeshwara.

00:09:31 Speaker 2

And then he has some really beautiful descriptions of his experience when he arrives here in the kind of heart of Udiyana, the sacred place.

00:09:40 Speaker 2

He says, when I saw from afar the country of Udiyana, my good inclinations became very strong.

00:09:49 Speaker 2

In these places, as soon as anyone has a realization, various dhakanies come privately in front of you as a spouse.

00:09:58 Speaker 2

This is an interesting little anecdote that he describes.

00:10:02 Speaker 2

And then he kind of arrives, he describes his arrival at Tumut.

00:10:08 Speaker 2

And this is a kind of suburb.

00:10:10 Speaker 2

It's identified as Budkara by Tuchi in a town called Mingora in Swat Valley.

00:10:17 Speaker 2

We'll be looking at maps in a moment.

00:10:21 Speaker 2

And he says some really interesting things about his arrival there.

00:10:23 Speaker 2

He says, by the mere view of this country, our cries of joy could not be counted.

00:10:27 Speaker 2

And he says, in front of that place, there is an image of the goddess called Mangala Devi, and it's made of sandalwood.

00:10:37 Speaker 2

This is a very important detail.

00:10:39 Speaker 2

He describes himself as sleeping before the statue.

00:10:42 Speaker 2

He has an interesting encounter with a Dakani there.

00:10:47 Speaker 2

All of these anecdotes kind of describe that even in the 13th century when this region was under the governance of Muslim rulers, there's clearly still a kind of culture of yoganis in this region.

00:11:01 Speaker 2

And then he proceeds to a cremation ground, which he calls Birshmasa, which Alexis Anderson argues is a name for Kadavira Shmishasana.

00:11:16 Speaker 2

the charnel ground, Shmishasana, called the Karavira.

00:11:20 Speaker 2

And he describes it in his travelogue.

00:11:24 Speaker 2

He says it's crowded by terrific assemblages of dangerous dakinis who have the shapes of boars, poisonous snakes, kites, crows, and jackals.

00:11:33 Speaker 2

And then he says a little north of it, there's trees called Okusha Vriksha, and there's trees called Mangala Vriksha, and the proximity of a spring called Mangala Pani.

00:11:45 Speaker 2

And he also mentions a mountain to the east called Sri Parvata.

00:11:49 Speaker 2

Okay, all of that information will be relative in a moment.

00:11:52 Speaker 2

I just wanted to kind of review it really quickly.

00:11:56 Speaker 2

What I want to kind of focus on now is the geography of this region.

00:12:01 Speaker 2

Here we have highlighted the Swat Valley, and the Swat River runs through it.

00:12:08 Speaker 2

And you can also see here the Indus River.

00:12:12 Speaker 2

And so this is the particular region where the traveler went to.

00:12:15 Speaker 2

This is also the region where the two principal scriptures of the Krama tradition identify themselves as originating from.

00:12:24 Speaker 2

And here we have Kashmir, the veil of Kashmir.

00:12:28 Speaker 2

In John's talk, he spoke about these different dwaras or entryways into the valley.

00:12:35 Speaker 2

And the journey of

00:12:37 Speaker 2

Organpah kind of came south of Kashmir.

00:12:42 Speaker 2

He actually went to Kashmir after his visit to Udiyana in the 13th century.

00:12:48 Speaker 2

This is actually the modern town of Hund, which was originally called Uda Banda.

00:12:53 Speaker 2

And this is the capital of the Shahi kings who ruled this region from the 9th to 10th century.

00:13:01 Speaker 2

And so this is the town where, in Swat Valley,

00:13:05 Speaker 2

on the Swat River of Mingora.

00:13:08 Speaker 2

And so this is where Burgimpa arrived here.

00:13:12 Speaker 2

The kind of place that he describes has been identified, Dumat has been identified with this suburb here, Budkara.

00:13:23 Speaker 2

And then he describes going to a further place north, where there's stone images of the Buddha Tar and Lokeshwara, and that's been identified here as Mangalore.

00:13:33 Speaker 2

And there's also this town, Odigrama, which might be one of the villages he refers to.

00:13:37 Speaker 2

So this is what he sees as the sacred center of the region of Udiyana.

00:13:45 Speaker 2

And in the town that's further north, Mangalawar, Mangal Lore, it's described as a place where Indraputi founded a temple.

00:13:55 Speaker 2

And it has this extraordinary Buddha that's encarved into the stone.

00:14:00 Speaker 2

This is one of the features

00:14:02 Speaker 2

of a lot of the carvings in this region.

00:14:05 Speaker 2

Sometimes they're kind of carved into the mountain to make-- or into stones or cliffs to appear as if they're swayambu, kind of self-manifested or appearing.

00:14:14 Speaker 2

And Aurel Stein visited this, but in 1926, and he complained about how difficult it was to capture it by photo.

00:14:22 Speaker 2

And it's partly because you have to actually be 10 meters below it to kind of see the relief of the image.

00:14:29 Speaker 2

And this is one of the larger Buddhas in this region.

00:14:33 Speaker 2

It's actually the largest, except for the ones that are in Bamiyan in Afghanistan.

00:14:38 Speaker 2

And the face was actually destroyed by the Taliban, but it's since been repaired.

00:14:44 Speaker 2

And so there's, above this, there's evidence of an old stupa.

00:14:49 Speaker 2

This was clearly an important place in the time period that we're looking at.

00:14:55 Speaker 2

Here's another map of the Swat Valley and the Swat River.

00:14:59 Speaker 2

Budkara, where Orgyanpa arrived, is right here, #1.

00:15:06 Speaker 2

Udigram or Odigrama is here, #3.

00:15:09 Speaker 2

And there's also Barikot.

00:15:12 Speaker 2

There's an inscription here in Barikot, an Asharadad inscription from the 10th century.

00:15:20 Speaker 2

And it describes the town of Barikot

00:15:25 Speaker 2

as Vajiristan or Vajristan, and it also mentions the king Jayapala, and it's in Sharada.

00:15:31 Speaker 2

And so this is really important 10th century evidence of a few things.

00:15:35 Speaker 2

One that the Shahi kings were rulers of this region at that time.

00:15:39 Speaker 2

And another, this interesting name, Vajristan, that is, this town has been the site of a lot of archaeological work by the Italian Archaeological Survey.

00:15:52 Speaker 2

And there's actually two books, I think, that recently came out studying that region.

00:15:58 Speaker 2

So we have this identification of Udayana with this region.

00:16:04 Speaker 2

At one level, we can think of this as a pita, that's an identifiable topography that's marked as a dynamic site for esoteric religious culture.

00:16:16 Speaker 2

But as I mentioned earlier, it's also an experiential locus that's projected onto the human body.

00:16:23 Speaker 2

It's a site where the body is the site where you worship the Pitta.

00:16:27 Speaker 2

It's also something that's worshipped externally within a mandala.

00:16:32 Speaker 2

And it's also a site of memory.

00:16:35 Speaker 2

Particularly in the Vajrayana Buddhist traditions, there's a number of narratives of siddhas and yoginis who flourished in Udayana, and the hagiographies of them are quite extraordinary.

00:16:47 Speaker 2

And so one of the ways that Ulrik Krag, who's worked on those texts, describes Udayana is a chronotope of myth and history.

00:16:57 Speaker 2

And in this talk, I'm really going to be looking more at it as a historical site.

00:17:04 Speaker 2

Okay, so here it goes.

00:17:06 Speaker 2

I'm venturing beyond my comfort zone into the political history of the region of Udayana.

00:17:12 Speaker 2

And I want to tell you a little bit about the Hindu Shahi dynasty.

00:17:18 Speaker 2

This is based on a dissertation, *The Last Two Dynasties of the Shahis*, by Abdur Rahman, which he wrote in 1976.

00:17:25 Speaker 2

It's an extraordinary work of scholarship, but I've also updated it with some of his later scholarship.

00:17:31 Speaker 2

And he is bringing together archaeological evidence, the writings of Persian and Arabic authors describing this time period, the *Raja Tarangani*, and other sources.

00:17:44 Speaker 2

It's a really extraordinary synthesis.

00:17:46 Speaker 2

But before I look at these kings of the 9th to 10th century and early 11th century, I just want to say something about the region in which they ruled.

00:17:56 Speaker 2

This region is home to some of the most extraordinary archaeological treasures in world history.

00:18:04 Speaker 2

Pakistan is an incredible site for world history.

00:18:08 Speaker 2

There's evidence of Gandhara grave culture going back to 800 BCE.

00:18:13 Speaker 2

Alexander the Great traveled through this region and ruled this region.

00:18:17 Speaker 2

He visited Odigrama.

00:18:19 Speaker 2

This is studied by Aurel Stein.

00:18:23 Speaker 2

After Alexander the Great, the Seleucid Empire, a great Hellenistic state, was founded in the wake of Alexander.

00:18:30 Speaker 2

There's evidence of the Mauryan Empire here.

00:18:32 Speaker 2

There's rock edicts of the ancient Indian King Ashoka, written in Kharoshti script.

00:18:38 Speaker 2

And there's also evidence of the layer of the Kushan Empire.

00:18:42 Speaker 2

And so what I want to focus on here is the Shahi dynasty, the Hindu Shahi dynasty, which came on the heels of the Turk Shahi dynasty that John Nemece spoke about.

00:18:53 Speaker 2

In terms of it being called Hindu, there's a couple of reasons why they call it.

00:18:58 Speaker 2

One is that the historian Al-Biruni, who was writing in Arabic and was a part of the court of Mahmud of Ghazni,

00:19:07 Speaker 2

describes it that way.

00:19:09 Speaker 2

He describes it as Shahiyat al-Hindiya.

00:19:13 Speaker 2

And he mentions that the first king of this dynasty was a Brahmin.

00:19:18 Speaker 2

But Abdul-Rahman, in his dissertation, proposes that these kings were actually originally of the Udi or Odi clans.

00:19:27 Speaker 2

And this is an ancient tribe from the region, the broader region of Gandhara.

00:19:32 Speaker 2

The Udis and the Odis were powerful kings during the Kushan period.

00:19:36 Speaker 2

And this may also be the source of the very name Udiyana.

00:19:40 Speaker 2

And several villages that exist in Gandhar that bear the name Udi Grama.

00:19:45 Speaker 2

And as I mentioned, Alexander in 326 BCE visited a village in Swat called Udi Grama.

00:19:55 Speaker 2

The Shahi dynasty had a winter capital at Hund, which is on the Indus River south of Udiyana.

00:20:03 Speaker 2

and a summer capital in Kabul, in Pakistan, sorry, Afghanistan.

00:20:08 Speaker 2

And the first king, Kalar, usurped the crown from the last Turk Shahi king.

00:20:14 Speaker 2

He did that through power gleaned from the discovery of a treasure, according to an interesting myth.

00:20:21 Speaker 2

There's not much else known about Kalar, but the next king, Samantadeva, there's a number of coins.

00:20:27 Speaker 2

We have a couple here.

00:20:29 Speaker 2

And these numismatics reveal that

00:20:32 Speaker 2

His name was common throughout this entire dynasty.

00:20:35 Speaker 2

These coins were not only found from his period, but also later periods and were used in later periods.

00:20:43 Speaker 2

One feature of his reign is that he lost Kabul to an invasion of Yaqub.

00:20:49 Speaker 2

He most likely appointed his successor, Kudara Yaqa, as a governor, given that we have coins in his name from this period.

00:20:59 Speaker 2

And

00:21:00 Speaker 2

Lalia is the first king who's actually mentioned by Kalhana in the Raja Tarangani, this great author of the River of Kings, describing the dynasties of Kashmir.

00:21:11 Speaker 2

He's described, so here we are, Lalia.

00:21:15 Speaker 2

He's described as a great ruler whose enormous strength and power made other kings of the region take refuge in him, which is classic kind of rhetoric.

00:21:25 Speaker 2

He held power in Gandhara and in Kabul in 900 CE.

00:21:29 Speaker 2

He had an alliance with the Gurjaras, and his town is described in Rajatarangani chapter 5 as being Udabanda.

00:21:38 Speaker 2

That's kind of his main center of his kingdom.

00:21:41 Speaker 2

There's a story how Shankara Varman, the Kashmirian king of that time, desired to remove him from his position, but died before he could accomplish it.

00:21:49 Speaker 2

And then Prabhakara Deva, who's the minister of Gopala, Varman, and Kashmir, plundered the riches of an amorous queen in the court.

00:21:59 Speaker 2

and vanquished the Shahi king at Buddha Panda.

00:22:02 Speaker 2

So we have a war, according to Raja Tirangani, between the Kashmiri political powers and Lalia.

00:22:15 Speaker 2

And this is really clearly a time where there's kind of competition between the empires.

00:22:23 Speaker 2

After that conquering of Lalia, Toramana or Kamalu was kind of established by the Kashmirian conquestor as the king.

00:22:32 Speaker 2

And this really marks a transformation in the relationship between the Shahi kings and the kings of Kashmir.

00:22:40 Speaker 2

Bhima Deva is described in certain sources.

00:22:44 Speaker 2

He's the next king.

00:22:45 Speaker 2

There's not much on Kamalu.

00:22:49 Speaker 2

as Paramabhartaraka, Maharaj Rajadhiraja, Parameshwara, Sri Bhima Deva Shahi.

00:22:58 Speaker 2

He was the son of Kamalavarman or Kamalu, and the title Parameshwara describes him as having Shaiva affiliations.

00:23:08 Speaker 2

The Raja Tarangani mentions that Udabanda was his capital.

00:23:13 Speaker 2

His name's also mentioned in a Sharada inscription from Hund, which is Udabanda, that region, a Slav inscription dated to 989 CE.

00:23:22 Speaker 2

And he's identified as the predecessor of Jayapaladeva and also as the grandfather of a Kashmirian queen, Dida.

00:23:38 Speaker 2

And this is because his daughter married Simharaja, who is a Lohara chief of southern Kashmir.

00:23:44 Speaker 2

So it's really in Bhima Deva's reign that we have a kind of marriage alliance between these two kingdoms.

00:23:51 Speaker 2

And the daughter, Dida, became the queen of Kashmir, and she actually ruled somewhat ruthlessly during the life of Abhinavagupta.

00:24:01 Speaker 2

And so from this marriage alliance onwards, the relationship between the Shahi kingdom and the Kashmir Pahladi continually improved.

00:24:09 Speaker 2

Kashmir became a source of assistance and even a place to seek refuge for later Shahi kings when they were faced with military onslaught of the Ghaznavid Empire.

00:24:23 Speaker 2

So, and then we have Jaya Pahladeva.

00:24:26 Speaker 2

We have a number of inscriptions during his time.

00:24:29 Speaker 2

He had a number of battles.

00:24:32 Speaker 2

with Mahmud of Ghazni and also his father before him.

00:24:36 Speaker 2

Mahmud of Ghazni attacked India in 1000 CE.

00:24:42 Speaker 2

And the Shahis were really the first kings, the first dynasties who opposed the spread of his military power.

00:24:50 Speaker 2

And basically, the next kings all saw the territory of the Shahi dynasty reduced from the attacks of Mahmud of Ghazni.

00:25:00 Speaker 2

And eventually, many of these kings had to take refuge in Kashmir.

00:25:04 Speaker 2

And there was also military alliances with Kashmir kings at that time.

00:25:09 Speaker 2

Okay, that's a really quick snapshot of the Shahi dynasty.

00:25:12 Speaker 2

I could have done an entire talk on them, but I want to transition to some of the inscriptions from this era.

00:25:17 Speaker 2

This is the Slab inscription from Hund.

00:25:20 Speaker 2

This is a description in Sharada script.

00:25:24 Speaker 2

Another interesting thing about the two dynasties is that they share the same script.

00:25:28 Speaker 2

And

00:25:29 Speaker 2

Just a little bit about this inscription.

00:25:32 Speaker 2

It's an inscription of a grandson of a minister of the king, Jayapala.

00:25:39 Speaker 2

And it's a description where he's describing the establishment of an image of Shiva and a Shiva temple.

00:25:47 Speaker 2

And it begins with this beautiful benediction to Shiva.

00:25:50 Speaker 2

I bow to the third eye of Shiva, the Lord of spirits, the Buddhanatha, which abides on his forehead, the third eye.

00:25:58 Speaker 2

Even today, enemies fear that I would scorch Kamadeva, and then first bowing my head to eternal Shiva, may I, the son of Pangula, generate Shiva's fame through my own powers in this realm, through the establishment of this image of Shiva.

00:26:15 Speaker 2

There's a reference to Bhima, Jayapala's predecessor.

00:26:19 Speaker 2

There's a reference to Jayapala at the end, and this is in his homeplace of

00:26:27 Speaker 2

Uda Panda.

00:26:28 Speaker 2

And we have a number of other descriptions from Uda Panda.

00:26:31 Speaker 2

It's modern Hund in Pakistan.

00:26:34 Speaker 2

You can see it here.

00:26:35 Speaker 2

You can see that it's pivoted kind of between Kashmir over here to the east and Kabul over here to the west.

00:26:45 Speaker 2

So this was originally their, one of their main strongholds, which was taken over.

00:26:51 Speaker 2

And then we have up here, the Swat, sorry,

00:26:57 Speaker 2

Let's see, yeah, up here, the Swat Valley.

00:27:00 Speaker 2

So this is the general region that was ruled by the Shahis.

00:27:04 Speaker 2

There was some tension along this border with Kashmir kings, and then really they kind of got pushed E because of the attacks of Mahmud of Ghazni.

00:27:16 Speaker 2

They also ruled down into Punjab region as well.

00:27:20 Speaker 2

I want to just share briefly some of the other inscriptions

00:27:23 Speaker 2

These are all brought together by Noemi Verdon.

00:27:28 Speaker 2

She mentions one that honors Shiva under several epithets as Bhutanatha.

00:27:34 Speaker 2

These are all from the period of the Shahi dynasty.

00:27:37 Speaker 2

Bhutanatha, Sharaba, Shittikanta, Pinakin, Umaanatha.

00:27:40 Speaker 2

It refers to the town of Udupanda as located by the Indus River and having houses of learned men.

00:27:48 Speaker 2

It celebrates and praises the water of the Indus.

00:27:51 Speaker 2

and it's written in Sharada script in 989 CE.

00:27:56 Speaker 2

There's another one, which is called the Barikot Inscription, and that's the one that mentions this town of Vajrastana or Vajirastana.

00:28:07 Speaker 2

There's one by a queen named Maharagni Sri Kameshwari Devi.

00:28:12 Speaker 2

It's dedicated to the construction of a temple.

00:28:15 Speaker 2

It describes the architect and

00:28:19 Speaker 2

one of the scribes of the inscription, who's a Surya Dweja, probably a Brahmin devoted to Surya.

00:28:26 Speaker 2

Another inscription is called the Ishwara inscription.

00:28:29 Speaker 2

It's possibly dedicated to the construction of the temple of Shiva.

00:28:33 Speaker 2

And the last inscription is a Proto-Sharada inscription dated between the 7th and 9th century.

00:28:39 Speaker 2

And it also alludes to meritorious deeds of establishing a temple.

00:28:46 Speaker 2

And what's interesting in all of these

00:28:49 Speaker 2

inscriptions is the common reference to Shiva's, to temples devoted to Shiva.

00:28:56 Speaker 2

And we have this really beautiful Ekamukha linga from the Shahi dynasty, which is currently in the Metropolitan Museum from this time period.

00:29:06 Speaker 2

So clearly, these kings, not only in their title and in the inscriptional evidence, were at the very least patrons of Shaivism.

00:29:18 Speaker 2

John mentioned Michael Meister's book, Temples of the Indus, and there's this really extraordinary temple in Mallot, which is in the region of the Shahis, that they constructed from this time period.

00:29:31 Speaker 2

And what's interesting about it is that it mimics the architectural plan and style of the temples of Kashmir.

00:29:41 Speaker 2

It has

00:29:45 Speaker 2

architectonic massing and a pent roof, which is found in Kashmir.

00:29:51 Speaker 2

And it's unique in doing so in all of the temples along the Indus River that Michael Meister studies.

00:30:00 Speaker 2

Only the Shiv Ganga Temple also seems to have this pyramidal roof structure.

00:30:05 Speaker 2

And these were built at a time, Michael Meister notes, of matrimonial and political links between the Udi Shahis and the kings of Kashmir.

00:30:16 Speaker 2

And so not only do we have marital political alliances, but we also have shared architectural practices related to religious establishment of temples.

00:30:29 Speaker 2

And so I think that's also just an extraordinary piece of evidence of their relationship.

00:30:35 Speaker 2

Okay, I did it.

00:30:37 Speaker 2

I made it through all of my study of the material culture and the political and archaeological history and the epigraphy.

00:30:44 Speaker 2

of that region, now I can move to my comfort zone, which are the texts.

00:30:48 Speaker 2

So I want to look at the textual corpus of Udayana, as I'm calling it.

00:30:53 Speaker 2

But this textual corpus is not only the early Krama scriptures that I'll focus on in the beginning that describe this cremation ground that's in the travelogue of Organpah, but it also includes many Vajrayana Buddhist sources that identify themselves with this region.

00:31:10 Speaker 2

And what's interesting is all of these texts are not only claiming to be from the same region, so they have the same locality, but they're also from the same time period, the time period I'm focusing on, which is the 9th to 10th centuries.

00:31:23 Speaker 2

So all of these texts together across those traditions, I'm calling the textual corpus of Udayana.

00:31:32 Speaker 2

And one of the things I've noted by studying them initially are extraordinary parallels between them.

00:31:40 Speaker 2

We have a really interesting focus of narrative accounts of siddhas and yoginis.

00:31:46 Speaker 2

These texts all share what we might call a trans ritual orientation, which I'll describe more in detail.

00:31:54 Speaker 2

These texts also are really important early sources that give unambiguous teachings or doctrines of non-duality.

00:32:04 Speaker 2

And there's a prevalence as well of female authors, and not only female authors, but female gurus and female lineage holders across this corpus.

00:32:14 Speaker 2

And there's also an interesting theme of a kind of critique of intellectual study.

00:32:18 Speaker 2

A lot more could be said about parallels, but these are the things I'm going to focus on.

00:32:26 Speaker 2

Okay, so there's this early Shakta tradition called the Krama.

00:32:31 Speaker 2

It's based on various forms of the goddess Kali.

00:32:36 Speaker 2

And this is the scriptural corpus of the Krama as we have it.

00:32:40 Speaker 2

And the texts I'm going to focus on are these three, the Devi Panchasataka, the Kramasatbhava, and the Yoni Gavara.

00:32:46 Speaker 2

I'm dating them all to the 9th to 10th century.

00:32:48 Speaker 2

I'll give some evidence on that in a moment.

00:32:52 Speaker 2

The Devi Panchasataka and the Kramasatbhava are often given the prefix Kali Kula, but instead of that long name, I'm just going to call them

00:33:00 Speaker 2

by the short name.

00:33:01 Speaker 2

We have this earlier source, which Olga Serbaeva has done a lot of really important work on, the Jaidratayamala.

00:33:08 Speaker 2

She also dates it between the 9th and 10th century, but there's parts of it that clearly have something like a proto-form of the Krama tradition.

00:33:19 Speaker 2

But the Devi Panchashataka and the Krama Sedbhava are really seen by Alexis Sanderson as the principal scriptures of the Krama tradition.

00:33:29 Speaker 2

The yoni gabra is a little more random.

00:33:32 Speaker 2

We also have a Devi Dvardashatika, which is extant, and a lost Devi Sardashatika.

00:33:38 Speaker 2

But I'm really gonna focus on these three.

00:33:41 Speaker 2

And one thing I'll just say at the outset, as early as the Kramasadbhava and the Yonikavara, we have a basic organizing principle for understanding what the Krama tradition is.

00:33:54 Speaker 2

And it's described by three elements, pujana, katana, and sankramana.

00:34:01 Speaker 2

And Pujana refers to the worship of different series of Kalis.

00:34:07 Speaker 2

There's early evidence of worshipping these forms of Kali externally in the mandala.

00:34:14 Speaker 2

But by the time we get to the principal scriptures, they start to be worshiped as phases or sequences of the practitioner's own perception or cognition.

00:34:24 Speaker 2

And so we have this kind of internalized mode of worship or Pujana.

00:34:29 Speaker 2

A lot of the Krama sources are focused upon that practice.

00:34:33 Speaker 2

We also have katana, which are oral teachings, pith instructions.

00:34:38 Speaker 2

We have an extraordinary element of the Krama tradition that preserves these pith instructions, which I'll be highlighting.

00:34:45 Speaker 2

And then sankramana is a kind of direct transmission, a non-verbal kind of awakening that can be detonated by

00:34:55 Speaker 2

something as simple as a glance of the guru, and is seen as kind of the most expedient form of transmission.

00:35:02 Speaker 2

When it comes to Krama sources that relate to Uddiyana and Karavira, and specifically this revelation that happened there between this yogini or form of Kali named Mangala

and Jnanetra, who's really the kind of first Siddha who is honored within the Krama tradition, who's

00:35:22 Speaker 2

kind of outside of the mist of mythology, we can kind of date historically and who we have a text by.

00:35:30 Speaker 2

There's a number of sources.

00:35:31 Speaker 2

You could say that this particular lineage of the Krama is the most influential one.

00:35:39 Speaker 2

This is a quick list of texts that either are in this lineage that come from Mangala and Gyananetra, or at least refer to them.

00:35:50 Speaker 2

And it's not comprehensive.

00:35:52 Speaker 2

I just didn't have time to write more text, but it's an initial list.

00:35:56 Speaker 2

So we have a large body of literature related to this particular transmission.

00:36:02 Speaker 2

And so you could say that this is an extended part of what I'm calling the Udayana corpus, or the textual corpus of Udayana.

00:36:09 Speaker 2

But when it comes to the Krama, in terms of the 9th and 10th century, I'm really focusing on these scriptures.

00:36:17 Speaker 2

And then on the Buddhist side, we have, in the same period,

00:36:20 Speaker 2

A number of texts, importantly, the Seven Siddhi texts, which are all identified as this early Mahamudra teaching that comes from Udayana and is from the same time period.

00:36:29 Speaker 2

And then other sources.

00:36:31 Speaker 2

And here's a list from Ulrich Crag of a number of sources that are actually attributed to women authors from Udayana.

00:36:40 Speaker 2

But many, many more sources could be added to this list.

00:36:44 Speaker 2

Again, this is just a small sample.

00:36:46 Speaker 2

How do we know these texts came from Udayana?

00:36:49 Speaker 2

The Sahaja Siddhi Parati, which is only preserved in Tibet and of Lakshmi Khara, gives really interesting hagiographies of a lineage in Uddiyana and short stories of the members of that lineage, including an autobiographical description of her own sadhana, which is really extraordinary.

00:37:06 Speaker 2

But not only that, we have the name Uddiyana in some of the texts.

00:37:11 Speaker 2

And the colophons of the texts also mention that this text

00:37:16 Speaker 2

Vinirgata or Udbhava arose in Udayana.

00:37:21 Speaker 2

Another fascinating thing which allows this corpus to be studied by somebody like me is that many of these texts are preserved in Sanskrit sources, especially in Nepal.

00:37:32 Speaker 2

Okay.

00:37:34 Speaker 2

So I want to look at these two principal Krama scriptures.

00:37:38 Speaker 2

As I mentioned, they locate themselves in Karavira cremation ground in Udayana.

00:37:46 Speaker 2

And the first is the Kali Kula Devi Pancha Shatika.

00:37:50 Speaker 2

It begins with this benediction, which is also found in two other early Krama scriptures.

00:37:55 Speaker 2

So we have a kind of textual parallel there.

00:37:57 Speaker 2

And it's a benediction to Kali.

00:38:00 Speaker 2

And then immediately it describes a setting of the revelation of the scripture.

00:38:05 Speaker 2

And I'm just going to read this.

00:38:06 Speaker 2

The cremation crowned Karavirika of the auspicious northern seat, Srimad-Uttarapita, is venerated by Shiva, the god of gods, the supreme self.

00:38:16 Speaker 2

That cremation ground is blazing with a great funeral pyre, frequented by great yogis, thronged with powerful ghosts, and attended by the great mother goddesses.

00:38:27 Speaker 2

It is full of practitioners whose yoga is profound, venerated by great siddhas, filled with excellent ascetic huts, and resounding with intense

00:38:36 Speaker 2

howling, bestowing the best cities crowded with powerful bhairavas, fierce because it is utterly terrifying.

00:38:43 Speaker 2

It is filled with a powerful radiance.

00:38:46 Speaker 2

Bhairavi, who is present there, is terrific, conforming to the gross and subtle realms.

00:38:52 Speaker 2

She is accompanied by the Piteshwaris and encircled by siddhas.

00:38:58 Speaker 2

So here we have

00:39:00 Speaker 2

an extraordinary description of a cremation ground in Udayana, which potentially corresponds to the one from our 13th century itinerary, the Tibetan travelogue.

00:39:14 Speaker 2

The Piteshwaris we'll discuss in a moment, but the Devi Panchashataka continues in a description of Kali or Bhairavi who is present there.

00:39:25 Speaker 2

She is immersed in profound bliss and she destroys

00:39:28 Speaker 2

cruel, great terror, that supreme Shiva, utterly quiescent, is expanding with intense radiance, connected to a set of eight Bhairavas.

00:39:36 Speaker 2

She is associated with eight sets of eight yoginis, 64 yoginis.

00:39:41 Speaker 2

Bhairava, the deity who is a terrifying form of Shiva, clasped the two feet of the goddess.

00:39:48 Speaker 2

Bowing his head down to the goddess, he said these words, which were prefaced by astuti, a song of praise.

00:39:54 Speaker 2

So in this frame story of this scripture,

00:39:57 Speaker 2

there's a really interesting feature that Alexis Anderson describes, which is that Bhairavi, or Kali, is actually the teacher of the scripture, and Bhairava is the questioner.

00:40:09 Speaker 2

For those of you familiar with Shaiva and Shakta Tantra, this is a reversal of the normal role, and I think it's the earliest scripture we have, where the goddess is the teacher, and Bhairava Shiva is the one who's ignorant.

00:40:22 Speaker 2

And so the frame story begins in Karavira,

00:40:25 Speaker 2

Bhairava is there, and he clasps her feet, and he gives, he sings this really beautiful stuti, which I've translated here, which I won't read for time.

00:40:37 Speaker 2

And then he goes on to ask her for the teaching, and then she reveals it, which is basically the content of that scripture.

00:40:46 Speaker 2

The other text, the other principal Krama scripture that identifies itself with Kairavira is a Krama Sadbhava.

00:40:53 Speaker 2

And I want to read this.

00:40:55 Speaker 2

In that auspicious part of the northern region, there is a great Pitta called Odiyana, the best seat of the goddess, attended by siddhas and yoginis.

00:41:05 Speaker 2

I want to highlight something here.

00:41:08 Speaker 2

This Pitta of Odiyana is described as being in the Uttara Dik Bhaga.

00:41:15 Speaker 2

This

00:41:16 Speaker 2

Alexis Anderson mentions that this is a really important reference to a regional location.

00:41:22 Speaker 2

It's in the Uttaradik Bhaga, which literally means the northern region.

00:41:28 Speaker 2

This is further evidence that we're talking about most likely Swat Valley and not other places where there are, where Udayana has been visualized or mapped, or other places where there are Karavira cremation grounds, like in the Deccan.

00:41:46 Speaker 2

So in that preeminent and lovely Pitta, there is the Karavirka charnel ground, endowed with great funeral pyres, and surrounded by powerful mother goddesses, extraordinary depths, Yakshas, Kinaras, Rakshasas, Vetalas, throngs of ghosts, ghouls, and Brahma Rakshasas, spirits and Kinaras.

00:42:02 Speaker 2

They're all there, terrifying and extremely powerful.

00:42:06 Speaker 2

There is Dakani, Rakani, Lakani, Kakani, Sakani, surrounded by Hakanis and many Putanas, you know.

00:42:15 Speaker 2

demonesses.

00:42:17 Speaker 2

This particular list is also found in the Yoni Gavara and the Devi Dvi Ardha Shataka.

00:42:24 Speaker 2

That cremation is residence in every part to wrathful Bhairavas.

00:42:28 Speaker 2

It's thronged with tantric heroes, created depths, and endowed with great sky-faring yoginis, with resounding with the howls of jackals and other powerful roars.

00:42:38 Speaker 2

It is dancing with hordes of countless yakshas,

00:42:41 Speaker 2

on all sides.

00:42:42 Speaker 2

I love these descriptions.

00:42:43 Speaker 2

They're so amazing.

00:42:46 Speaker 2

Some people there are attracted to the chakra observance.

00:42:48 Speaker 2

Others are fully devoted to meditation.

00:42:50 Speaker 2

Some are drawn to the libations of tantric heroes, and others to intense ecstatic gatherings, hatha melapaka.

00:43:01 Speaker 2

In that utterly terrifying circle filled with great mothers, the supreme goddess abides, Kali.

00:43:07 Speaker 2

Established at the limit of the state of self-reflective awareness,

00:43:12 Speaker 2

She's enthroned upon Bhairava.

00:43:14 Speaker 2

She has the nature of the void, Vyoma Rupa.

00:43:17 Speaker 2

She is infinite in the eight form Shiva.

00:43:20 Speaker 2

She's ornamented by 50 Rudras and well attended by 64 yoginis.

00:43:26 Speaker 2

Brahma, Vishnu, Rudra, Ishvara, Sadashiva, and Bhairava are all corpses that form her throne, although Bhairava ends up not completely becoming a corpse but remains comatose.

00:43:39 Speaker 2

This

00:43:41 Speaker 2

the way in which these gods are turned into pretas or corpses is a symbolic understanding that this tradition transcends all of the earlier traditions and including the Bhairava tantras.

00:43:57 Speaker 2

Similarly to the Devi Panchashataka, Bhairava clasps the two feet of the goddess.

00:44:02 Speaker 2

And then before you ask her question,

00:44:05 Speaker 2

gives a stuti.

00:44:06 Speaker 2

So we have a parallel structure across these two scriptures in terms of the frame story.

00:44:11 Speaker 2

That stuti is much longer in the Kramasatbhava.

00:44:13 Speaker 2

It's actually really interesting.

00:44:15 Speaker 2

It has a lot of fascinating epithets for Kali.

00:44:19 Speaker 2

And then the question of Bhairava here is really interesting.

00:44:23 Speaker 2

He asks, why did these 64 powerful yoginis, born of tantric heroes, all come to this terrifying seat of the goddess, intent on your veneration?

00:44:32 Speaker 2

and eager to celebrate the Mahayaga, the great sacrifice.

00:44:37 Speaker 2

And then he asks about the highest reality.

00:44:39 Speaker 2

And then the last thing he says here is, teach me that supreme secret.

00:44:44 Speaker 2

Bring to light the teaching, abiding in the heart of the Yoginis.

00:44:48 Speaker 2

Who are these 64 Yoginis?

00:44:50 Speaker 2

Well, in the Krama tradition, they're described as Piteshwaris, female adepts or divinities of the Pita, of Uddiyana Pita.

00:45:01 Speaker 2

And

00:45:02 Speaker 2

In the Krama Sadbhava, the revelation is understood not to just be with Bhairavi, who is Kali, but actually with these female adepts, this group of 64, it's residing in their hearts.

00:45:16 Speaker 2

And this is really important, that these kind of female retinue of the goddess are the ones who have the revelation.

00:45:26 Speaker 2

Okay, so yeah, that was that last line.

00:45:29 Speaker 2

In terms of the Yoginis of Udhayana,

00:45:33 Speaker 2

The Krama Siddhava is unique in that it actually gives this categorization of the 64 yoginis or Piteshwaris, and it describes them as siddhas, a unique feminine form of siddha, and presents them there in Karavira cremation ground, once again as a source of revelation.

00:45:54 Speaker 2

And in chapter 2, it describes 16 Jnana siddhas, 24 mantra siddhas, 12 melapa siddhas,

00:46:00 Speaker 2

and eight Shakti Siddhas and four Shambhava Siddhas.

00:46:04 Speaker 2

These come to be corresponded to different mudras and many other things in the later Krama tradition.

00:46:11 Speaker 2

The Kramasattbhava doesn't give us the name of these 64 yoginis, but interestingly, we too have texts that give the names.

00:46:21 Speaker 2

There's the Kalikula Kramarchana, which is the subject of a

00:46:28 Speaker 2

awesome dissertation that recently came out of Oxford by Pangsit Pangsrivongse.

00:46:34 Speaker 2

And it's by Vimala Prabodha.

00:46:39 Speaker 2

And it's a Nepali work in the Kali Kula tradition.

00:46:43 Speaker 2

And it is unique in that it gives a lot of the ritual details of the Kali Kula tradition and of the Krama tradition.

00:46:52 Speaker 2

And it gives names for all 64 yoginis.

00:46:57 Speaker 2

Another source that does is a text called the Nitya Puja, which is actually from Kerala.

00:47:03 Speaker 2

And this text is a study of an article by Maciej Karanzinski, who's currently at Stanford working with Elaine Fisher, but who also did a PhD in Kalikat in Kerala.

00:47:18 Speaker 2

And it's really interesting in that it has Sanskrit and Malayalam.

00:47:23 Speaker 2

And it represents a tradition of the Krama that flourishes to this day in Kerala.

00:47:29 Speaker 2

And it also actually gives the names of these 64 yoginis.

00:47:35 Speaker 2

The Kramasad Bhava itself says one should obtain the names which are the Guruvaktara Gata, which are basically the preserve of the oral tradition.

00:47:45 Speaker 2

So basically, I'm not going to tell you the names.

00:47:47 Speaker 2

You have to get them from your guru.

00:47:49 Speaker 2

Finally, I just want to mention about these yoginis,

00:47:52 Speaker 2

that Harish Wallace has kind of collated all of these different lists of these 64 yoginis.

00:47:58 Speaker 2

And one of the things he's shown is that even though the number 64 is quite stereotypical when it comes to yoginis, these names do not correspond to other lists of 64 yoginis that are associated with a lot of the yogini temples that start flourishing in the 11th centuries and afterwards.

00:48:15 Speaker 2

And so

00:48:16 Speaker 2

We potentially have a list of non-typical names of female adepts from Karavira cremation ground.

00:48:25 Speaker 2

I say that with a pinch of salt, but it's an interesting thing to consider.

00:48:32 Speaker 2

The Devi Panchashataka does not describe these 64 yoginis, but it gives a list of siddhas that are central to the lineage and worshiped within the mandala, and this is in chapter five,

00:48:45 Speaker 2

of the Devi Pancha Shataka.

00:48:46 Speaker 2

It corresponds to chapter 29 of the Tantra Aloka.

00:48:49 Speaker 2

We get this really important list, which is recapitulated in many Kaula sources afterwards, of four Yuganathas, four different masters of the four ages.

00:49:01 Speaker 2

Kagendranatha in Vijamba, Kurumanatha in Mangalamba, Mesanatha in Kama Mangala, and Meenanatha in Konkanamba.

00:49:09 Speaker 2

Meenanatha is Machandanatha, famously Matsyendranatha.

00:49:13 Speaker 2

They have 12 sons, six are celibate and six are non-celibate.

00:49:17 Speaker 2

And they're all kind of included within the mandala of this early tradition.

00:49:24 Speaker 2

After that, the Devi Pancha Shataka gives another list of siddhas and their consorts.

00:49:29 Speaker 2

This list is quite important for us.

00:49:31 Speaker 2

Nishkriyananda and Jnana Deepti, Vidyananda and Rakta, Shaktyananda and Mahananda, Shivananda and Samaya.

00:49:38 Speaker 2

Tantraloka refers to this obliquely with this verse, that there are other gurus and their wives that are taught in the Srimad Kalika Kula, or Srimad Kalikula, referring to the Devi Pancha Shataka.

00:49:51 Speaker 2

And Shivananda is the name that's most important for us because it's an alias of Jnana Netra.

00:49:58 Speaker 2

And Jnana Netra, as I mentioned, flourished from 850 to 900.

00:50:02 Speaker 2

We have one text by him, the Kalika Stotra.

00:50:05 Speaker 2

And

00:50:08 Speaker 2

He has an alias, which is Shivananda.

00:50:11 Speaker 2

Sanderson gives a number of examples of where he's described as Shivananda.

00:50:16 Speaker 2

And so we have a name of a historical identifiable guru within a scriptural list of Siddhas.

00:50:25 Speaker 2

Nishkriyananda is also important in the early Krama and also in later texts affiliated with the Krama, just to go back here.

00:50:32 Speaker 2

He's 2 generations before Shivananda.

00:50:37 Speaker 2

He's less clearly identifiable as a historical author, but we have this early Kubjika work, a very important text, the Chinchini Matasara Samuccia.

00:50:46 Speaker 2

It actually gives a revelation narrative of how Nishkriyananda taught the Kalika Krama teaching to Vidyananda.

00:50:54 Speaker 2

And there's two texts embedded in the 7th chapter of the Chinchini that are kind of go with this revelation narrative.

00:51:03 Speaker 2

And

00:51:04 Speaker 2

We have the Kalika Krama Shuloka Dwadashika and the Kalika Krama Panchashika.

00:51:09 Speaker 2

This is a really important lineage.

00:51:11 Speaker 2

And one thing that's important about it is that it's not located in Ludhiana.

00:51:16 Speaker 2

It's identified instead with one of the famous Pittas, Srisailam, which is in Andhra Pradesh.

00:51:26 Speaker 2

And so we have another kind of

00:51:29 Speaker 2

lineage and seat of the goddess for where an important early lineage of the Krama emanates.

00:51:35 Speaker 2

In terms of other sources related to Nishkriyananda, there's a lot of Chumas and Sutra texts, these oral teaching texts related to Katana, that mention him.

00:51:44 Speaker 2

Importantly, the Chumasankheta Prakasha, where there's a fascinating narrative of his reception of the teachings from a Siddhanatha, and then his kind of elucidation of those teachings.

00:51:58 Speaker 2

There's the Kaula Sutras.

00:52:00 Speaker 2

In both these texts, Nishkriyananda's interestingly identified it with Dauravasas, the great irascible sage.

00:52:06 Speaker 2

And then the Vatulanatha Sutra doesn't mention him, but mentions a Vatulanatha, who may be a reference to Unmatanatha, who's found in the Kaula Sutras.

00:52:18 Speaker 2

But if we look at Shivananda and Gyana Netra, we have this extraordinary lineage that flourishes in Kashmir for many, many centuries.

00:52:27 Speaker 2

There's unanimity, unanimity, there's a unanimous conclusion across all of the texts in this lineage that Gyananetra received the Kalika Krama or the Krama revelation from Mangala in Kairavira cremation ground in Udayana, in the northern Pitta.

00:52:48 Speaker 2

And interestingly, Gyananetra and his Kalika Stotra ends it with these two verses.

00:52:56 Speaker 2

In the very way I witness or I perceive the transcendent nature of the goddess and the great cremation ground, may this entire universe be seen in that way through your grace, O Mother.

00:53:09 Speaker 2

Thus, the praise of the nature of the goddess Kalika has been set forth by me, Shiva, or by me who is in one with Shiva, under the influence of the state of perfect immersion in it.

00:53:23 Speaker 2

May it be a true blessing for all who are in fact me,

00:53:26 Speaker 2

bow goddess named Mangala.

00:53:28 Speaker 2

So here we have this important reference to Mahashima Shani.

00:53:31 Speaker 2

So what I want to do now, really briefly, is try to date the baby Panchashantika hypothetically.

00:53:39 Speaker 2

I'm not on really firm ground here, but there's a lot of extraordinary evidence just worth kind of synthesizing.

00:53:45 Speaker 2

Gyananetra has a firm date.

00:53:49 Speaker 2

And the Kali Ka Stotra that he wrote, Sinarshan shows one place where it clearly echoes the Devi Pancha Shatika, one of the principal Krama scriptures.

00:54:00 Speaker 2

In addition to that, the Kali Ka Stotra draws for a couple of things on the Devi Pancha Shatika and on the Krama Sadbhava.

00:54:09 Speaker 2

On the Krama Sadbhava, he draws on this idea of the Vrinda Chakra, which are the 64 yoginis plus one who is their leader, who is

00:54:18 Speaker 2

Kali or Mangala.

00:54:20 Speaker 2

And from the Devi Panchashataka, it draws on the worship of 13 Kalis.

00:54:27 Speaker 2

The Kramasit Bhava is different, that it worships 17 Kalis in that same phase.

00:54:31 Speaker 2

So there's textual evidence that these two texts are earlier than Jnanetra, which would make them 9th century.

00:54:40 Speaker 2

We know they're at least 10th century because, as I mentioned, Abhinavaguta cites the text.

00:54:45 Speaker 2

One of the

00:54:46 Speaker 2

really interesting citations is in chapter 35 of the Tantrahaloka.

00:54:50 Speaker 2

So we know it's at least 10th century.

00:54:54 Speaker 2

But then we have the colophons of both the principal scriptures, which claim to be revealed by a certain Srinatha.

00:55:01 Speaker 2

So these texts are said to be revealed of a Tarita by Srinatha.

00:55:06 Speaker 2

Who is Srinatha?

00:55:07 Speaker 2

Sinderson proposes that it might actually be Jnanetra.

00:55:10 Speaker 2

And this is because in the Tantrahaloka Viveka,

00:55:15 Speaker 2

Abhinavagupta's commentator describes him as an Avataraka Siddha.

00:55:19 Speaker 2

And we do have one scripture, the Yoni Gavara, that said, that places itself in Karavira, Shmashasana, in Udayana, and says that it's been brought to light on earth, Bhutala Sam Prakashitam, by Jnana Netra.

00:55:36 Speaker 2

So if he's an Avataraka of this scripture, at least one part of it, then

00:55:42 Speaker 2

Maybe he is the Srinatha who revealed or redacted these other scriptures.

00:55:47 Speaker 2

There's some additional evidence that might make this compelling.

00:55:50 Speaker 2

One is that the Yoni Kavara has the same list of siddhas as the Devi Panchashataka.

00:55:59 Speaker 2

And

00:56:00 Speaker 2

It has the same Mangala, as I mentioned.

00:56:02 Speaker 2

And the end of the text parallels the end of the Devi Panchashataka.

00:56:06 Speaker 2

There's a series of verses.

00:56:09 Speaker 2

It's probably like 7 verses that are parallel.

00:56:11 Speaker 2

I haven't done a large analysis of their relationship, but that's some evidence that Srinatha may in fact be Jnana Netra.

00:56:22 Speaker 2

So we can confidently say these two principal scriptures were before 850 to 900 or sometime at that time.

00:56:31 Speaker 2

Madhav Lami Chane did a Nepali edition, sorry, a critical edition and a Nepali translation recently of the Devi Pancha Shataka, which is an incredible contribution.

00:56:42 Speaker 2

And he surmises that since Shivananda is mentioned as one of the Siddhas in the Devi Pancha Shataka,

00:56:52 Speaker 2

It's most likely that the redactor, Jnanenetra, would not mention himself, and so he thinks that it must be a little later than Jnanenetra.

00:57:00 Speaker 2

But anyways, it's a pretty small time range.

00:57:05 Speaker 2

The Yoni Gavra is composite, as Sanderson notes, there's another lineage and another teaching, that's a Krama.

00:57:10 Speaker 2

It comes from Virasimhav Swamini, another name from Mangala, to Rupananda, a Yogini, and then to a Siddha named Ogananda.

00:57:18 Speaker 2

Okay, very briefly, to conclude,

00:57:21 Speaker 2

I just want to look at a few comparative passages with these Vajrayana texts from this region.

00:57:28 Speaker 2

One is that across these texts, we have what we might call a trans ritual orientation.

00:57:33 Speaker 2

It doesn't mean that there aren't references to rituals, ascetic observances, and worshipping with mandalas.

00:57:41 Speaker 2

There are those elements, but for the most part, there's this common theme, you could say a leitmotif across these texts, of going beyond outer ritual.

00:57:51 Speaker 2

We see this in the Advaya city of Lakshminagara with parallels in the Guhya city of Padma Vajra, where we have basically this idea that this sadhana, the supreme sadhana is vijnana without any reference to ritual location, to ritual times, to lunar phases or the lunar calendar, to different use of mandalas, to fasting,

00:58:18 Speaker 2

to Akshara Uchara, to the kind of upward recitation of mantras, even to forms of meditation, and to niyamas, to different restrictions.

00:58:29 Speaker 2

Anyway, so we have a number of things that this teaching is seen to be beyond.

00:58:36 Speaker 2

And then this really interesting thing, with the actions of body, speech, or mind, one should not build chaityas or other edifices made of stone or clay.

00:58:46 Speaker 2

take delight in a book, or create mandalas, even in a dream.

00:58:50 Speaker 2

We see this, more of this theme.

00:58:54 Speaker 2

I didn't have time to translate these, but here's another set of passages for you all to take note of and check out.

00:59:01 Speaker 2

The Kramasadhya Bhava echoes this extraordinarily.

00:59:04 Speaker 2

When the goddess gives the teaching, actually when Bhairava asked for it, he says, teach me that secret, supreme secret, incomprehensible by reason, guileless.

00:59:16 Speaker 2

The teaching that is free of considerations of lunar calendar, the propitious hour, free of considerations of place time beyond the conventions of ritual sites, alignments of constellations plan is devoid of mudras and mandalas, beyond the use of colored powders to make mandalas, free of the need to invoke deities into the mandalas without vows, post-initiatory observances.

00:59:39 Speaker 2

A lot of this language is really parallel.

00:59:41 Speaker 2

We have a lot of the same terms.

00:59:43 Speaker 2

Titi, Desha, Kala, Nakshatra, Sthana, Mudra, Mandala, et cetera.

00:59:50 Speaker 2

There's another fascinating thing that I don't have time to explore now, but both of these texts have extraordinary narratives of siddhas and yoginis as mediators of revelation.

01:00:01 Speaker 2

That's something I explore in my dissertation.

01:00:05 Speaker 2

Another feature is the doctrine of non-duality.

01:00:08 Speaker 2

The Devi Pancha Shatika and the Kramasattbhava are some of the earliest Shakta scriptural sources to be explicitly non-dual in their outlook.

01:00:17 Speaker 2

They teach this kind of dynamism of conscious, non-dual consciousness as their basic cosmology.

01:00:23 Speaker 2

And a number of sources from both texts are synthesized in Yudhit Torzak's article, Non-dualism in Early Shakta Tantras.

01:00:31 Speaker 2

And she describes a kind of progression

01:00:34 Speaker 2

of the emergence of the doctrine of non-duality within early Shakta traditions.

01:00:40 Speaker 2

We see this across the Vajrayana sources associated with Udayana as well.

01:00:46 Speaker 2

I'm not going to reference them now.

01:00:49 Speaker 2

I just want to show one more thing, which is really fun.

01:00:51 Speaker 2

There's this really interesting critique of intellectual study.

01:00:54 Speaker 2

I don't think Abhinavagupta would dig it, or maybe some more scholastic Vajrayana scholars.

01:01:00 Speaker 2

The Kramasad Bhava teaches, you know, teach me the secret that is apratarkyam.

01:01:04 Speaker 2

incomprehensible by reason.

01:01:06 Speaker 2

The Svabodha Siddhi by Abhinabhagupta's guru says, what can the perplexities of roaming through technical knowledge systems accomplish for one who abides in the self continuously in all states?

01:01:18 Speaker 2

The Sri Pita Dwadashika says, the goddesses of the cremation ground called Karaviraka are supreme.

01:01:24 Speaker 2

They dispel the networks of concepts belonging to philosophical doctrines.

01:01:29 Speaker 2

We see the same thing in the Guyana city of Indrabhuti.

01:01:32 Speaker 2

One who has gained wisdom should not give a teaching from a book, and the Adwaya Siddhi and the Guhya Siddhi do not delight in a book.

01:01:41 Speaker 2

Not only does Abhinavagupta not agree with that, I think I don't agree with that, but there you have it.

01:01:49 Speaker 2

I'm going to skip this and go straight to my conclusion, but I'll just briefly tell you what it is.

01:01:54 Speaker 2

There's evidence of kind of two directions of influence between the corpuses, the Buddhist and the Shakta.

01:02:02 Speaker 2

On the Buddhist side in the Guhya Siddhi, there's this extraordinary passage where an adept and advanced practitioner does an unmata vrata, the kind of madman observance.

01:02:15 Speaker 2

And what they do is they enter a Shaiva community, a low-caste Shaiva community.

01:02:22 Speaker 2

They dress up like a Shaiva ascetic.

01:02:26 Speaker 2

They, with all of the different accoutrements, with the tiger skin, with various ornaments or bone ornaments, with the Damaru, the drum associated with Shiva, adorned with fragments of bone.

01:02:38 Speaker 2

And they teach that community tantric teachings from 2 Shaiva texts, the Kalotara and the Nishwasa.

01:02:50 Speaker 2

So a clear reference.

01:02:51 Speaker 2

that whoever's doing this observance in Uddiyana is clearly versed in Shaiva Tantra.

01:02:57 Speaker 2

But not only do they do that, they actually initiate the community in the mandalas of those systems in order to gain their trust.

01:03:05 Speaker 2

And then they take one of their daughters as a consort.

01:03:09 Speaker 2

It's just an extraordinary piece of evidence that clearly there's shared knowledge between these esoteric traditions.

01:03:18 Speaker 2

And then on the proma side,

01:03:21 Speaker 2

There's a lot of language in the Siddhi texts, which is pretty clearly the source for language in the Krama texts.

01:03:28 Speaker 2

The Krama sources, both the scriptural and all later ones, continually talk about going beyond sat and asat, existence and non-existence.

01:03:38 Speaker 2

And we find this teaching not only in the Siddhi texts of the Buddhist corpus, but also in many other earlier Buddhist sources,

01:03:45 Speaker 2

Sanderson also mentions the krama is unique in that it frequently uses the term niswa bhava, or free of inherent nature.

01:03:53 Speaker 2

That is completely unique within Shaiva and Shakta literature.

01:03:59 Speaker 2

There's other terminological things.

01:04:01 Speaker 2

The goddess Kali is often described as Maha Shunya or Shunyati Shunya, the Shunya beyond the Shunya.

01:04:08 Speaker 2

So you clearly have the influence or maybe the kind of influx of certain Buddhist concepts.

01:04:15 Speaker 2

that are influencing the Krama.

01:04:17 Speaker 2

Okay, thank you for your patience.

01:04:20 Speaker 2

Here are my conclusions.

01:04:23 Speaker 2

First of all, there is an early reference to Udayana before these Krama scriptures.

01:04:28 Speaker 2

It's found in the Tantra Sadbhava.

01:04:30 Speaker 2

I discovered it recently and I thought it was a great discovery, only to realize that it's there in Mark Dikskowski's introduction to the Mantana Empire of a Tantra and an obscure footnote.

01:04:41 Speaker 2

So thank you, Mark G.

01:04:43 Speaker 2

Udayana plays a vital role in the Kubjika Tantras and in the post-scriptural literature of Sri Vidya.

01:04:50 Speaker 2

This is something I'm just noting, but I don't have time to go into because I focused on the Krama.

01:04:56 Speaker 2

However, of all of the early Shakta traditions, it's the principal scriptures of the Krama which identify themselves as being revealed in Karavirika cremation ground,

01:05:07 Speaker 2

These are the best candidates for a Shaiva Shakta tradition with historical connection to the Swat Valley.

01:05:13 Speaker 2

This is further bolstered by a deep consensus across many Krama sources that Jnana Netra in the 9th century received the Krama there from Mangala.

01:05:23 Speaker 2

As if you remember going all the way back to the beginning, we have Mangalore or Mangalavar or Mangalapura, the image of the goddess Mangala there that's seen in the 13th century by Orgyempan.

01:05:36 Speaker 2

Further proof is found in the description of Gyananetra as the revealer of the Yoni Gavara and Karavira and Udayana.

01:05:43 Speaker 2

The relationship between Swat Valley and Kashmir was clearly political and also religious in the 9th to 10th centuries.

01:05:50 Speaker 2

There were marital and military alliances, a shared script, and Shahi temples with Kashmirian influence during this time period.

01:05:59 Speaker 2

The inscriptional record also shows evidence of the Shahis patronizing Shaiva temples.

01:06:04 Speaker 2

There's a significant, finally, a significant body of textual evidence awaiting further comparative study from the 9th to 10th century, which I've dubbed the textual corpus of Udayana.

01:06:19 Speaker 2

A final note, why do we not find a lot of material evidence for these actual traditions, these esoteric traditions that flourish there?

01:06:28 Speaker 2

I think the verse from the Advaya Siddhi of Lakshmi Kara

01:06:33 Speaker 2

is really instructive here.

01:06:35 Speaker 2

It says, do not build chaityas, do not build images made of clay or stone.

01:06:43 Speaker 2

These are traditions, and you see this also in the Krama, that are not focused on the worship in temples.

01:06:49 Speaker 2

They're not focused on the worship of images.

01:06:52 Speaker 2

In fact, the body itself becomes the mandala, the source and the kind of locus of worshipping all the deities.

01:07:01 Speaker 2

So thank you so much.